A Narrative Conceptualization of the Imposter Phenomenon: Implications for Supervisors of Beginning Counselors

Joel A. Lane
Portland State University, lanejoel@pdx.edu

Citation Details
http://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/coun_fac/27
A Narrative Conceptualization of the Imposter Phenomenon: Implications for Supervisors of Beginning Counselors

JOEL A. LANE, MA LPC NCC
DEPARTMENT OF COUNSELING
OAKLAND UNIVERSITY
ROCHESTER, MI
Problem Statement

- During practicum, internship, & the beginning years of professional counseling, counselors’ internal models of ‘quality therapy’ are confronted with the realities of practicing for the first time, typically resulting in some degree of anxiety.

- Trainees have differing abilities to understand and cope with this anxiety.

- Some feel as if they have ‘faked’ their way to this point in development, and that their fraudulence is about to be discovered.
Session Goals

- Learn about the imposter phenomenon (IP; Clance & Imes, 1978) & characteristics of its experience among beginning counselors

- Apply various Narrative Therapy (White & Epston, 1990) concepts to supervisory practice

- Develop a narrative framework for understanding the IP & how to address it using a narrative supervisory approach
The Imposter Phenomenon (IP)

- Clance & Imes (1978)

- General inability to internalize successes

- Describes individuals (generally high-achieving) who believe:
  - They are incompetent despite contradictory evidence
  - They are less capable than their peers
  - Their abilities are overestimated by peers
  - Others will eventually discover their incompetence
IP Behavior & Personality Correlates

- Theorized to occur more in women, but data point to no differences in frequency of IP by gender (see Royse-Roskowski, 2010; Topping, 1983)

- IP leads some to over-prepare (Caselman, Self, & Self, 2006) & some to self-handicap (Want & Kleitman, 2006)

- Associated with:
  - Trait anxiety (Topping, 1983)
  - Depression (McGregor et al., 2008)
  - Low self-esteem (Sonnak & Towell, 2001)
  - Low self-efficacy (Royse-Roskowski, 2010)
  - High neuroticism & low conscientiousness (Bernard et al., 2002)
  - Proneness to shame (Cowman & Ferrari, 2002)
Differentiating the IP from Low Self-Efficacy

- Royse-Roskowski (2010):

  - Study of master’s & doctoral trainees in various counseling & psychology training programs

  - Counseling self-efficacy & the IP were negatively related; however:
    - Amount of counseling experience (prior experience, months in program, months in practicum, direct hours) positively related to self-efficacy but was not related to the IP

- Essentially, experience increases self-efficacy, but does not affect the IP
IP & Achievement Motivation

- The Dweck model (Elliot & Dweck, 1988)
- Two basic motivations for achievement:
  1. Learning goals: motivated by desire for knowledge
     - Respond to challenges/failures with resilience
  2. Performance goals: motivated by desire to prove intelligence
     - Respond to challenges/failures with helplessness/self-blame
- Langford (1990)
  - Participants given unsolvable anagrams
  - IP strongly correlated with ‘Performance goals’ motivation style
Key challenges for new counselors with IP tendencies:

- Psychosocial impact-
  - Prone to respond to new challenges & difficulties with feelings of helplessness
  - Prone to anxiety, shame, neuroticism, low conscientiousness
  - Imposter feelings may not diminish with experience
IP in Supervision of Counseling Trainees

- Key challenges for new counselors with IP tendencies (continued):

  - Threats to skill level-
    - May result in self-handicapping (procrastination, lack of effort, etc.)

  - Threat to supervisory relationship-
    - Difficulty internalizing successes, may either rely on external praise or have difficulty accepting it productively
    - May live in fear of being ‘found out’ by supervisor, instructor, or clients
Narrative Therapy (White & Epston, 1990)

- Theory
  - Meaning developed through societal, relational, and experiential influence
  - Helps us categorize & know what to expect (e.g. ‘I am a good student’), which then shapes future understanding

- Problem conceptualization
  - Problematic discourses (e.g. ‘I am depressed’) become dominant & internalized

- Therapeutic Goals
  - Externalize problem narratives
  - Awareness of larger, structural influence (discourses)
  - Choose, gather evidence for, & develop preferred narratives
Applying Narrative Concepts to Supervision

- **Speedy (2000)**
  - Using narrative inquiry to deconstruct dominant professional narrative and develop preferred professional identity
  - Repositioning supervisee as ‘narrator’ and supervisor as ‘critical audience’

- **Carlson & Erickson (2001)**
  - The supervisory power hierarchy can potentially undermine supervisee creativity
  - Framing supervision as a time of knowledge acquisition reinforces a sense of ‘never quite measuring up’
  - Instead, supervision should be a ‘rite of passage’ by which supervisors help supervisees become aware of and utilize their own ‘special’ life knowledge
Narrative Conceptualization of the IP

- External praise & validation
- Personal narratives intermingle performance & self-worth
- Anxiety: temporary relief when successful, amplified when challenged
- Dominant societal discourses of comparison, expectations, achievement
Narrative Supervision Goals of Reducing the IP

- Deconstruct & externalize ‘performance = self-worth’ narrative

- Facilitate the awareness & development of supervisee’s unique knowledge and how to utilize it with clients

- Develop ‘thick descriptions’ of self & performance containing both strengths and developmental areas, thereby reducing reliance on external validation
Narrative Supervision Objectives for Reducing the IP

- **Narrative inquiry to develop richer understanding of supervisee’s ability**
  - “There was a lot of complexity in what your client was sharing. Tell me how you were able to put all the pieces together and come up with a response like that.”

- **Externalizing language to personify problem-saturated thinking & promote understanding that problem is separate from supervisee**
  - “Doubt and anxiety want you to think that this session was a disaster. If they weren’t whispering negative thoughts in your ears right now, how do you think your evaluation of the session might be different?”

- **Normalize anxiety associated with the challenges of beginning as a counselor**
  - “You’re embarking on a new journey to do something that is very important to you, and it’s natural for anxiety to want to come along for the ride, too.”
Conclusion

- Beginning counselors are at risk of imposter feelings as anxiety is high and experience & self-efficacy are low.
- Supervisors are in a unique position to play a powerful role in shaping beginning counselors’ understandings of their abilities.
- Narrative therapy offers concepts that are useful for conceptualizing the imposter phenomenon & for deconstructing the dominant narratives linking performance & self-worth and reconstructing a preferred narrative that normalizes strengths & growing edges.


