

Phi Alpha Theta Pacific Northwest Conference, 8–10 April 2021

Strangely Doesburg, Western Washington University, undergraduate student, “Allotrioemeis: Or, a Preposterous Preponderance of Pins Produced”

Abstract: *Sadducismus Debellatus*, the 1698 account of a witchcraft trial in Bargarren, Scotland, suggests new interpretations of witchcraft epidemiology. From late 1696 through 1697 a young girl named Christian Shaw experienced fits, visions, trances, and even levitation. More interesting, and decidedly the more tactile, was her tendency to demonstrate her affliction by vomiting various items: pins, straw, warm coals, balls of hair, and pieces of dung. Previous scholarship has dubbed this phenomena *Allotriophagy*, linking it to compulsive consumption conditions like Pica, seemingly overlooking their presence in contemporary Scottish medical literature. Furthermore, coincident accounts of stagecraft reveal numerous techniques were being practiced to produce such effects, indicating a connection between visibility of stagecraft magicians and the types of symptoms manifested by the bewitched. While this by no means precludes the supernatural, or proves intentional deception, the lack of public performance culture adjacent to trials in other areas suggests a connection. The alternate term *Allotrioemesis*, suggested by this paper, shifts the focus away from the act of putting objects into the mouth, and toward the startling effect production has upon the spectator. This shift in terminology opens alternative avenues for tracing the development of symptoms, and their spread through populations.

Allotrioemeis: Or, a Preposterous Preponderance of Pins Produced

Introduction

From the Biblical Witch of Endor to the supposed fiends menacing puritan Salem, history abounds with stories of witchcraft.¹ It seems witches are always appearing wherever people live in any numbers.² Studying the stories of the witches can offer insight into the ways cultures viewed such varied subjects as theology, gender, food, or even legal jurisprudence. Many historians have approached the task of examining accounts of witchcraft through these and many other lenses, but few have focused directly on particular symptoms. And yet, pursuing such narrow areas of focus creates numerous windows into the past, offering insight into the personalities that experienced these events. For the historian wishing to choose a particular symptom, the 17th century alone has any number of arresting ones to choose from. The victims of malicious devilry experienced everything from seemingly mild predicaments, such as butter refusing to churn, to hair-raising cases of demonic possession.³ Perhaps one of the most curious symptoms to manifest during the final century of witch hunts in the British Isles was one which took place around County Renfrew, Scotland in the late 1690s.⁴

On 12 November 1696, an 11-year-old girl named Christian Shaw began to produce numerous small objects from out of her mouth. Such an odd symptom was not out of the ordinary for a family seeking treatment for an extraordinary affliction: Christian Shaw was bewitched. Even before she began to vomit objects, her parents, John and Christian, had been disturbed enough to travel to the city several times looking for help. By the time they made their second trip to Glasgow, Christian had been suffering from swoons and fits for months, the latter of these occurring with “such Force, that Four strong Men were scarcely able to hold her.”⁵ Still, it must have felt like a significant escalation when the girl began to vomit a cornucopia of items including pins, straw, warm coals, balls of hair, and pieces of dung. Even more alarming, no one could account for where the objects had come from, despite the phenomenon being observed by “many witnesses” over the

¹ *The Holy Bible: King James Version* (2009). (Electronic Edition of the 1900 Authorized Version., 1 Sa 28:7-25). Via Logos Bible Software.

² Confirming or denying supernatural events is not an aim of this paper. For the people living these events they were real, and this is enough to give them weight for the historian. If the community believes a thing, and then alters their practices as a result, that is reason enough to treat it as significant.

³ And yet, as Diane Purkiss points out, the failure to churn butter could be the difference between starvation and survival in a time when “white meats” (that is butter, cheeses, etc.) were the principal source of protein. [Purkiss, *The Witch in History* p. 96]

⁴ Any writing dealing with the history of the archipelago containing England, Ireland, Wales, and Scotland must be, needs be, careful. The evolutions of identity and attendant border disputations in these islands are ongoing, and the risk exists of offending living persons therein. I shall endeavor to treat the four principal nations as separate countries whenever possible and use collective nomenclature such as “The British Isles” (when referring to the group,) or “Britain” (when referring to the largest of these). In this regard I follow the lead of Ronald Hutton. [Hutton, *The Witch*, p.13]

⁵ Grant, Sir Frances, Lord Cullen, *Sadducismus Debellatus, Or: A True Narrative of the Sorceries and Witchcrafts Exercis'd By the Devil and his Instruments upon Mrs. Christian Shaw, Daughter of Mr. John Shaw. in the County of Renfrew in the West of Scotland, from Aug. 1696 to Apr. 1697. H. Newman and A. Bell, Grasshopper in the Poultry, London, and at the Crosse Keys and Bible in Cornhill near Stocks-Market, 1698.* p. 2

nine-month period of the girl's affliction.⁶ Christian repeatedly experienced "fits" that varied from relatively harmless bouts of mild insensibility, to thrashings that caused those around her to fear for her life. The latter of these were so violent that "sometimes her Neck-bone seem'd to be dislocated."⁷

After weeks of fits and oral expulsions of "Hay, Feathers, such like Trash,"⁸ Christian began to see the cause of her maladies: witches, some of whom she recognized, were coming to her room at all hours. None of her caretakers could see these malefactors, but Christian continued to insist that they were present. Before long, her parents and the local constabulary became convinced that witchcraft was involved and arrests were made. Without fail, whenever one of the accused individuals was brought into the girl's room it would have a negative effect on the girl. If she was in her right mind prior to the arrival it would throw her into a fit, and if she was already experiencing one of her episodes, the entry of one of the alleged witches would be enough to send her into new heights of thrashing and screaming. All the while these fits were routinely accompanied by the expulsions of small objects from her mouth, of which pins were the most common.

Perhaps most arresting of all in the accounts of the girl are the multiple spiritual combats with the Devil himself. Several times throughout her sufferings Christian Shaw was confronted with the spectre of her ultimate adversary. She combated his advances upon her soul, and requests that she renounce her baptism, by quoting scripture at him. Often these scriptural expostulations displayed an understanding of scripture well beyond one of her years. Shortly after her final confrontation with the devil, the last of the witches she had accused was arrested. Less than a week later, on 28 March 1697, Christian Shaw was pronounced cured, never again to be troubled by the *maleficarum* of witchcraft.

The primary source for this hair-raising tale is the 1698 book *Sadducismus Debellatus*.⁹ The subtitle promised "A True Narrative of the Sorceries and Witchcrafts Exercis'd By the Devil and his Instruments upon Mrs. Christian Shaw, Daughter of Mr. John Shaw. in the County of Renfrew in the West of Scotland, from Aug. 1696 to Apr. 1697," and the book did not disappoint.¹⁰ Even though it billed itself as a straightforward account of the bewitchment and the resulting trial, a closer examination of *Sadducismus Debellatus* reveals the work of multiple narrators.

Chief and most obviously present is the composer of the piece, a narrator with a specific theological agenda. Published without attribution, *Sadducismus Debellatus* has often been credited to Sir Frances Grant,

⁶ Grant, *Sadducismus Debellatus* p. 4

⁷ Grant, *Sadducismus Debellatus* p. 17

⁸ Grant, *Sadducismus Debellatus*. Introduction

⁹ As noted above, the *complete* title of *Sadducismus Debellatus* is exceedingly long. [see footnote 3] This is a rather common feature of many of the books, broadsides, pamphlets and polemics referenced in this paper. In the interest of ease of reading, I will provide the full titles in the first note as well as referencing them in the bibliography. However, acknowledging this expansive nomenclature is key to understanding the printing milieu into which these works were released. One is reminded of the blurbs on the dust jacket flaps, initial pages, and back covers of 21st century books designed to give the reader a facile idea of their contents. This in turn implies an environment wherein these works were being read for more than edification; indeed, entertainment might have been a driving factor in the proliferation of such documents.

¹⁰ In the interest of pursuing an intensely granular examination of a particular aspect of the case depicted in *Sadducismus Debellatus*, I will forgo a lengthy summary within the body of this paper. For the reader of the paper who may be unfamiliar with the case of Christian Shaw, I have composed a brief summary with some commentary. [See appendix A.]

Lord Cullen, one of the legal experts involved in the case.¹¹ Despite the events depicted taking place in the Scottish legal system, this book was also presented to an English audience, indicative of the author's ambitions beyond a simple record of the events of a single trial. In "Last Major Witch Hunt, 1697-1700," Michael Wasser offers the explanation that Grant, with his close relationship to the trial as prosecutor, wrote *Sadducismus Debellatus* as much to speak in defense of his own actions as to educate the laity regarding witches.¹² This position is born out repeatedly in the text, as the author devotes significant space to defending the very existence of witches, and dismissing concerns that false convictions outweigh legitimate ones: "tho' oft-times False Witnesses set on by the Devil, have taken away an harmless Life, by accusing it of Crimes; yet the Testimony of Witnesses must still be credited."¹³ Grant's concern was well founded: as Wasser demonstrates in "The Last Witch-Hunt" judicial interest was moving away from belief in witchcraft. Although soon to be decriminalized, ordinary people continued to believe in the possibility of witchcraft, something Grant saw as a potential tool of the Devil. By presenting a record that, in his mind, proved witchcraft was alive and well in the British Isles, Grant intended to solidify his position against witches.

While Grant's agenda may have driven the composition and publishing of his narrative, his is not the only voice apparent in the book. In her book *The Witch in History*, Diane Purkiss presents the witch as the "blank screen onto which the fantasies of her neighbors were projected."¹⁴ This reading of witchcraft narratives takes into account the central role that women, both as accusers and accused, played in creating the idea of what a witch was. This is a far cry from the mere victims, or pawns, of a nebulous gendercidal conspiracy or post-feudal pogrom to institute capitalism that some historians have put forward.¹⁵ Instead Purkiss recontextualizes the identity of "Witch," as something women actively chose to create. For accusers, it provided a modicum of control over the narratives of their lives, prioritizing their knowledge and creating situations where they were listened to. For the accused, it could be a label they created, rather than one forced upon them. In fact, by courting this identity women could fashion for themselves narratives of agency, power, and even status in a world that often offered them very little.¹⁶ When one applies Purkiss's reading to *Sadducismus Debellatus*, what emerges is a text full of the narratives created by numerous people, the majority of whom are women. Half a dozen are accused over the course of Grant's narrative, and some eventually admit to witchcraft, while others maintain their innocence, but there is also another storyteller, creating a narrative in an uncommon medium visible only in the effects it has upon those who witness it.

The central figure of *Sadducismus Debellatus* is Christian Shaw, the principal victim of the alleged witches. Even if "many of those she named were known to be Persons of ill fame," it is her sufferings that form the basis of all following accusations.¹⁸ It cannot be stressed enough that this is a narrative in which the word

¹¹ Wasser, Michael, Goodare, Julian. (ed.) "The western witch-hunt of 1697-1700 : the last major witch-hunt in Scotland" in *The Scottish Witch-hunt in Context*. Manchester, UK ; New York: Manchester University Press, 2002. p. 148

¹² Wasser, *Last Witch-Hunt* p. 158

¹³ Grant, *Sadducismus Debellatus*. P 50

¹⁴ Purkiss, *The Witch in History: Early Modern and Twentieth-Century Representations* p. 3

¹⁵ Federici, Silvia. *Caliban and the Witch*. New York : [London]: Autonomedia ; [Pluto, Distributor], 2004.

¹⁶ Gibson, *Reading Witchcraft* p. 31

¹⁷ Purkiss, *Witch in History* p. 144

¹⁸ Grant, *Sadducismus Debellatus* p. 7

of an 11-year-old girl is being taken as plain fact, by credulous adults. Beyond the immediate family and servants, “who were always present with her in her fits,” Grant lists over three dozen individuals who witnessed at least some of the events,¹⁹ among them lairds, knights, sheriffs, ministers, doctors, and judges. Two of these individuals, medical professionals from Glasgow (Doctor A. Brisbane²⁰ and Apothecary Henry Marshall²¹), even contributed signed affidavits of their experiences. Christian Shaw must have provided a truly compelling display of bewitchment to convince so many people. This level of belief was doubtless encouraged by the voiding of so many small objects, providing a solid tangibility unavailable to symptoms like dreams, fits, visions, and spectral combats. Since certainty is impossible, the historian must seek avenues of possibility. The centrality of this symptom provides numerous hints at one such avenue.

It must be stated emphatically that the goal of the following analysis is not to provide a specific explanation for any given phenomena. Without direct observation, and often at times even in spite of it, there is no guaranteed way to prove a certain event is what has occurred. There is much historical precedent for narratives of skeptical explanation, to be used as dismissive lenses when viewing accounts of the miraculous. Witchcraft is no exception. In fact, numerous early modern pieces seek to reveal the folderal behind bewitchment. One need only consider Wheeler’s *The Boy of Bilson* or Scot’s *Discoverie of VVitchcraft* for two excellent examples.²²²³ Scot believed that by exposing the methods used by charlatans to invoke supernatural power, such cases could be unmasked as nothing but nonsense. However, engaging in any simple binary as the aforementioned works do is counterproductive. By treating historical narratives as examples of one thing or the other, the historian misses out on numerous possible avenues.

¹⁹“...the Lord Bantyre, Mr. Francis Montgomery of Giffen, Sir John Maxwell of Pollock, Sir John Houston of Houston, Alexander Porterfield of Porterfield, the Laird of Black-hall younger, the Laird of Glandeertone, the Laird of Craigens, Porterfield of •...ullwood, John Alexander of Black-house, Mr. Semple Sheriff of Renfrew: And several other Honourable persons of good Sense and Quality as the Earl of Marshal•..., the Laird of Orbiston, the Laird of Killmarnock, the Laird of Meldrum, the Lairds of Bishopton Elder and Younger, Gavin, Cochran of Craigmure, William Denneston of Colgrain, Dr. Mathew Brisben, &c. And several Ministers, who kept days of Humiliation and Prayer weekly in the Family, and sometimes in the Parish-Church with the Congregation, viz. Mr. James Hutchison, Minister of the Gospel at Killelan, Mr. Patrick Simson of Renfrew, Mr. James Stirling of Kilbarchan, Mr. Thomas Blachwal of Paisly, Mr. James Brisban of Kilmacolme, Mr Robert Taylor of Houston; and of Neighbouring Presbytries, Mr. Neill Gillies, Mr. James Brown, Mr. John Gray Ministers of Glasgow, while the Damsel was there; Mr. John Ritchie Minister of Old Kilpatrick, Mr. Alexander King of Bonui•..., Mr. Archibald Wallace of Cardross, Mr. John A•...son of Drymmen, Mr. Andrew Turner Minister of the Place, who was frequently there: besides Mr. Menzies of Cammo, and Mr. Grant of Cullen, Advocates; who were Eye and Ear-witnesses to several important passages of the Damsels Affliction, and the convincing Evidences of its flowing from the Operation of the Devil, and his Instruments. The Truth whereof is further demonstrated by the Progress and Issue of the Tryal, at which were present, at several Occasions, not only Sir John Hamiltoun of Halcraig, one of the Senators of the Colledge of Justice, Sir John Shaw of Greenock, Commissar Smollet of Bonnill, Mr. James Stewart Advocat, who were concerned in the Commission with the others before mentioned: But also a great Confluence of several of the Nobility and Gentry out of the Countrey, such as the Earl of Glencairn, the Lord Killmares, the Lord Semple, &c.” (Grant, *Sadducismus Debellatus* p. 37-28)

²⁰ Grant, *Sadducismus Debellatus*. P 41

²¹ Grant, *Sadducismus Debellatus* p. 42

²² Wheeler, Richard Baddeley. *The Boy of Bilson: Or, A True Discoverie of the Late Notorious Impostures of Certain Romish Priests in Their Pretended Exorcisme, or Expulsion of the Diuell out of a Young Boy, Named William Perry, Sonne of Thomas Perry of Bilson, in the County of Stafford, Yeoman Vpon Which Occasion, Hereunto Is Premitted a Briefe Theologicall Discourse, by Way of Caution, for the More Easie Discerning of Such Romish Spirits; and Iudging of Their False Pretences, Both in This and the like Practices.* At London: Imprinted by F[elix] K[ingston] for William Barret, 1622. Web.

²³ Although not treated upon in this paper, *The Boy of Bilson* contains the revelation that young William Perry had, among other things, been caught faking allotriomesis.

While by no means trying to provide proof of definitive causes, this piece does seek to illuminate the kinds of information which could be learned from approaching these sources through a highly granular lens. By pursuing this single symptom and teasing out the different avenues of information it hints at, we can gain insight into the ways that the people within the text may have thought about their world. In particular, it gives insight into the mind of Christian Shaw, and the narrative she was constructing about herself as a victim of witchcraft.

Allotriophagy: One Specific Symptom

In *The Witch in History*, Purkiss writes: ““In our anxiety to be sympathetic to those accused of witchcraft, we must be careful not to muddle cruelties together, for only by retaining some sense of their specificity can we hope to understand them and their meaning for women.”²⁴ Much the same argument should be made regarding the symptoms displayed by the victims of witchcraft. These too can be read as a kind of text suggesting their own implications for the study of medical beliefs and even material culture.

Of all the symptoms manifested by 11-year-old Christian Shaw, the numerous incidents of vomiting small objects are perhaps the most disturbing. This may be because the historian can explain various types of bodily contortions, fits, and hallucinations by citing afflictions such as epilepsy, or blaming the delirium caused by a fever. Compared to these however, the repeated sight of a young girl coughing up dozens of non-food objects may leave an odd taste in the reader’s mouth.

If the scholar is seeking a greater precision when describing these symptoms, an appropriate term must be employed. Fortunately, Richard Golden’s *Encyclopedia of Witchcraft* includes an entry on this very phenomenon, dubbing it allotriophagy. Christian Shaw is a principal figure in the entry written by Gilbert Geis, who defines the malady as “the practice, particularly common to girls and young women who claimed to be bewitched, of regurgitating a variety of objects, such as pins, nails, and feathers.”²⁵ After lamenting that the word is “oddly omitted from the *Oxford English Dictionary*,” he points out that it derives from the Greek “to eat that which is strange.” (More specifically it is a composite of the roots “allotrio-” meaning “Strange or foreign,” and “phage,” meaning “people or other organisms that eat a particular food.”)²⁶²⁷ Geis goes on to state that “Today, allotriophagy is often referred to as *pica*, a term derived from the Latin word for magpie, a bird known

²⁴ Purkiss, *Witch in History* p. 235

²⁵ Golden, *Encyclopedia* p 30

²⁶ *Segen's Medical Dictionary*. S.v. "allotrio-." Retrieved November 8 2020 from <https://medical-dictionary.thefreedictionary.com/allotrio->

²⁷ "-phage, comb. form". OED Online. September 2020. Oxford University Press. <https://www-oed-com.ezproxy.library.wvu.edu/view/Entry/258782?rkey=K6gIMz&result=2&isAdvanced=false> (accessed November 08, 2020).

for its voracious and indiscriminate nature."²⁸²⁹³⁰ Geis writes that "the cause of pica, medical texts note, is poorly understood, though the most common explanation links it to a deficiency of iron in the body."

This diagnosis may be somewhat erroneous however. Modern reported cases of Pica are often centered around the consumption of metal objects, a list not always reflected in the wide variety of objects produced in early modern texts. Of the ones surveyed for this paper, the "metal deficiency" connection is only clearly visible in *Great News's*, "Abundance of Pins, Nails, Pewter, Brass, Lead, Iron, and Tin," which would indeed seem to suggest a deficiency of metals.³¹ Pica is not even the only possible culprit; the medical literature is rife with odd, poorly understood conditions which handily fit the "voidings" seen in early modern witchcraft accounts. For instance, these cases could be a result of Rumination Syndrome, a rare dysfunction of the purge reflexes in a human being. Rumination syndrome causes vomiting unaccompanied by many of the more painful and unpleasant associated effects, with patients simply passing the contents of their stomach back up and out of their mouths.³² While the condition is rare, it could have enjoyed greater interest in popular consciousness during the mid 17th century, especially in light of the vogue enjoyed in that era by performance arts like "water-spouting."³³ Such happenings would have been easy to fit into the overall pattern of witchcraft beliefs, as Hutton has noted is a tendency with peculiar events.³⁴ While such conditions are remarkably rare, it is also worth noting, as Gaskill has, that so were witchcraft trials.³⁵ Furthermore, the condition of Pica was recognized in 17th century Scotland. Alexander Ross's *Arcana Microsomi* mentions "a discase proceeding of natural causes, as that infirmity of eating chalk, coals, dirt, tar, ashes in in maids, and some married women, called by Physicians, *Pica* or *Malacia*, and is caused by the distemper of the phatasie, and sour malignant melancholy humors in the mouth and concavity of the stomach."³⁶ Since Pica was recognized by physicians in the area, it is notable that this is not offered as a solution in the case of Christian Shaw.

²⁸ Golden, *Encyclopedia* p 31

²⁹ Of some interest is the fact that the taxonomic designation of the Magpie is *Pica Pica*, literally "Eater Eater," or "Eat Eat." One is tempted to reference a certain board game featuring *Hippopotamus amphibius*.

³⁰ The Oxford Dictionary agrees with this correlation, providing an entry for it in the *Dictionary of Food and Nutrition*, though it remains absent from the standard O.E.D. The D.F.N. defines it as, "An unnatural desire for abnormal foods; also known as cissa, cittosis, and pica." [Bender, David A. "allotriophagy." In *A Dictionary of Food and Nutrition*. : Oxford University Press, <https://www-oxfordreference-com.ezproxy.library.wvu.edu/view/10.1093/acref/9780191752391.001.0001/acref-9780191752391-e-174>.] In typical dictionary fashion the terms cissa, cittosis and pica include variations on the previous sentence substituting the fourth alternative word, allotriophagy for cittosis in the latter's entry for instance. The final entry, "Pica" includes this additional information: "Also a perverted appetite (eating of earth, sand, clay, paper, etc.). Amylophagia is eating corn starch, geophagia is eating soil or clay (see also udongo), pagophagia is eating of ice." [Bender, David A. "pica." In *A Dictionary of Food and Nutrition*. : Oxford University Press, <https://www-oxfordreference-com.ezproxy.library.wvu.edu/view/10.1093/acref/9780191752391.001.0001/acref-9780191752391-e-4193>.]

³¹ Anonymous, *Great News from the West of England*

³² Papadopoulos, V., and K. Mimidis. 2007. "The Rumination Syndrome in Adults: A Review of the Pathophysiology, Diagnosis and Treatment." *Journal of Postgraduate Medicine* 53 (3): 203–6.

<http://search.ebscohost.com.ezproxy.library.wvu.edu/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=26280194&site=ehost-live>.

³³ See Part IV

³⁴ Hutton, *The Witch*, p. 380

³⁵ Gaskill, Malcolm. "The Devil in the Shape of a Man: Witchcraft, Conflict and Belief in Jacobean England." *Historical Research : The Bulletin of the Institute of Historical Research* 71, no. 175 (1998): 142-71.

³⁶ Ross, *Arcana Microcosmi* p. 71

But if Christian Shaw's is not a case of Pica, then what is it? Unfortunately by dubbing the phenomena "allotriophagy," and thereby linking it to consumption, Geis's nomenclature precludes certain avenues of reasoning. By using terminology which implies an intense desire to *consume* these objects, one risks missing a second source of intent for their presence in the mouth. These are indeed alien objects, however their presence is clearly a surprise to the victim voiding them as well, at least that is the narrative being presented in these cases. Thus a better word for this phenomena would be "allotrioemesis," a compound of allotrio- and "-Emesis," to vomit.³⁷³⁸ "allotriophagy" is too limited in its scope, as it indicates the provenance of any foreign object in the mouth as being the work of the victim, who must be suffering from "deficiencies, mental retardation, [or] developmental delays."³⁹ This diagnosis is further contradicted by the obvious intelligence of Christian Shaw, aptly demonstrated by her ability to read from the Bible to a degree professional ministers found impressive.⁴⁰ In an era when hegemonic modes of discourse are being challenged, this linguistic assignment of blame is unconscionable. This is why I propose the adoption of allotrioemesis as a more accurate substitute. If Pica was a recognized condition in the 17th century, and not always associated with witchcraft, then modern scholars should not make the same mistake.⁴¹

This nomenclatural fussbudgetry is necessary, as it reflects a distinction appreciated since at least the 1600s. The same Alexander Ross, who above noted Pica as an ailment, also listed the curious results of allotrioemesis. These were among the peculiar productions bodies are capable of manifesting in addition to a "Maid that voided Eels by the stool, which I conceive may proceed from a natural cause...pins that have been voided in Imposthomes, for stones begot in the bladder and kidneys, chalk in the joins of goudy bodies, are not so rare."⁴²⁴³

Such voidings are not limited to the case in *Sadducismus Debellatus*, or obscure references in medical texts. In fact, even a cursory examination of early modern sources on witchcraft reveals numerous accounts of people beset by curious voidings. In 1686, John Tonken of Cornwall began to vomit up pins, rushes, ears of rye, and even a piece of bramble.⁴⁴ The broadsheet "Great news from the West of England" tells of two young people (a woman and a man, both 18) who were witnessed "vomiting, or Throwing out of their Bodies, the

³⁷ "emesis, n.". OED Online. September 2020. Oxford University Press.

<https://www-oed-com.ezproxy.library.wvu.edu/view/Entry/61148?redirectedFrom=emesis> (accessed November 09, 2020).

³⁸ In light of this, I will be using this term for the rest of the paper.

³⁹ Golden, *Encyclopedia*, p 31

⁴⁰ Grant, *Sadducismus Debellatus* p. 5

⁴¹ Ross, *Arcana Microcosmi* p 71

⁴² Ross, Alexander. *Arcana Microcosmi: Or, the Hid Secrets of Man's Body Discovered;: In an Anatomical Duel Between Aristotle and Galen Concerning the Parts Thereof: as Also, by a Discovery of the ... Diseases, Symptomes & Accidents of Man's Body. With a Refutation of Doctor Brown's Vulgar Errors, the Lord Bacon's Natural History, and Doctor Harvy's Book De Generatione, Comenius, and Others; Whereto is Annexed a Letter from Doctor Pr. to the Author ...* Published by Tho. Newcomb, and are to bee sold by John Clark, entring into Mercers-Chappel, at the lower end of Cheapside, 1652 via Google Books. P. 70

⁴³ This fascinating list of superlative secretions goes on to note that, "Bees are begot of Valves flesh, Wasps and Hornets of Horses and Alles, and divers forms of Worms in our bodies, I have read of a Bird found in an Oyster...I will not speak of the Barnecles in the Scottish Seas, begot of old rotten planks of ships, nor of him that had a golden tooth..."

⁴⁴ Anonymous. *A True account of a strange and wonderful relation of John Tonken, of Pensans in Cornwall said to be bewitched by some women, two of which on suspicion are committed to prison, he vomiting up several pins, pieces of walnut-shels, an ear of rye with a straw to it half a yard long and rushes of the same length, which are kept to be shown at the next assizes for the said county.*

Abundance of Pins, Nails, Pewter, Brass, Lead, Iron, and Tin, to the Admiration of all Beholders.”⁴⁵ Similar maladies are enumerated in “The Hartford-shire Wonder, or Strange news from VVare,”⁴⁶ *A Tryal of Witches at the Assizes Held at Bury St. Edmonds*,⁴⁷ and “The most true and wonderfull narration of two women bewitched in Yorkshire”⁴⁸ to name but three more.

Although countless victims have claimed bewitchment through the centuries, far less have manifested the particular symptoms that Shaw and some of the above sufferers displayed. For example, while Shaw shares many elements of her affliction with the young girls from the Salem witch trials (fits, visions, and attacks perpetrated by unseen spiritual adversaries) allotriomesis is notably absent. Whereas the Salem records do reference blood coming from the mouth as the result of “fits,” this is the only thing which is seen to issue fourth from the victims, orally or otherwise.⁴⁹ Indeed, the only other references to mouths in general throughout the Salem records involve cattle, “wth their tounge hanging out of their mouths in a strange & affrighting manner,” and a man with a “tett...in his mouth.”⁵⁰⁵¹ This last is obviously a reference to the belief that witches fed their demons or familiars with a sort of supernatural nipple located in an unnatural part of the body.⁵³ This is only a brief survey of the Salem records, but the general comparison should suffice to make

⁴⁵ Anonymous. *Great news from the west of England being a true account of two young persons lately bewitch'd in the town of Beckenton in Somerset-shire, shewing the sad condition they are in by vomiting or throwing out of their bodies the abundance of pins, nails, pewter, brass, lead, iron, and tin to the admiration of all beholders, and of the old witch being carryed several times to a great river; into which her legs being tied, she was thrice thrown in, but each time she swam like a cork, afterwards by order from a justice of the peace she was search'd by a jury of women and such signs and marks being found about her, positive oath was given in against her so that she is committed to jayl until the next assizes.* London: Printed by T.M., 1689.

⁴⁶ Anonymous. *The Hartford-shire wonder. Or, Strange news from vware being an exact and true relation of one Jane Stretton the daughter [sic] of Thomas Stretton, of ware in the county of Hartford, who hath been visited in a strange kind of manner by extraordinary and unusual fits, her abstaining from sustenance for the space of 9 months, being haunted by imps or devils in the form of several creatures here described the parties adjudged of all by whom she was thus tormented and the occasion thereof with many other remarkable things taken from her own mouth and confirmed by many credible witnesses.* London: printed for John Clark at the Bible and Harp in West-Smith-Field near the Hospital Gate, 1669.

⁴⁷ Cullender, Rose, d. 1665. *A Tryal of Witches at the Assizes Held at Bury St. Edmonds for the Count of Suffolk on the Tenth Day of March, 1664 [i.e. 1665] before Sir Matthew Hale, Kt., then Lord Chief Baron of His Majesties Court of Exchequer / Taken by a Person then Attending the Court London,* Printed for William Shrewsbury ..., 1682.

⁴⁸ De Heer, Henri. *The most true and wonderfull narration of two women bewitched in Yorkshire who coming to the assizes at York to give in evidence against the witch, after a most horrible noise, to the terror and amazement of all the beholders, did vomit forth before the judges, pins, wool and hafts of knives, &c., all which was done (to make the wonder more wonderfull) without the least drop of bloud or moisture from their mouths : also a most true relation of a young maid not far from Luyck who being bewitched in the same manner did (most incredibly) vomit forth wadds of straw, with pins a crosse in them, iron nails, needles, points, and whatsoever she had seen in the basket of the witch that did bewitch her / as it is attested under the hand of that most famous phisitian Doctor Henry Heers ; together, how it pleased God that he was afterwards recovered by the art of physick, and the names of the ingredients and the manner how to make that rare receipt that cured her.* London: Printed for Tho. Vere and W. Gilbertson, 1658.

⁴⁹ Rosenthal, Bernard, and Adams, Gretchen A. [eds] *Records of the Salem Witch-hunt.* Cambridge ; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009. (Records 391, 428, and 541)

⁵⁰ Rosenthal, Bernard, and Adams, Gretchen A. [eds] *Records of the Salem Witch-hunt.* Cambridge ; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009. Record 464

⁵¹ Rosenthal, Bernard, and Adams, Gretchen A. [eds] *Records of the Salem Witch-hunt.* Cambridge ; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009. Record 474

⁵² Both of these references are preserved from the original with their archaic spellings intact. It should be noted that some of these were based upon notes taken in haste during depositions or questionings, and as such preserving these original spellings serves to keep the vivacity of the originals. When reading history there is a temptation to view old records as something stale and lifeless, when in reality much the opposite was often true. Human beings have always possessed the same level of mental acuity and interest in the world around them, therefore, we must never lose sight of the fact that these are documents produced by people, with human feelings and modes of thought, however alien they may appear at first blush. For an excellent piece of scholarship seeking to tackle this very issue, see *The Great Cat Massacre and Other Episodes in French Cultural History* by Robert Darnton.

⁵³ Purkiss, *Witch in History* p. 130

the point that, even in places of remarkably similar witchcraft beliefs, allotrioemesis is not a guaranteed symptom.

Since these curious expulsions are not *de riguer*, what could be their cause? One possible solution lies in the very performative nature of allotrioemesis. The “Great admiration” “of all Beholders” witnessing these events does seem to indicate that they were indeed an inherently theatrical thing to witness.⁵⁴⁵⁵ Geis certainly sees the phenomena in this manner. He notes that it “illustrates the tendency of persons claiming to be bewitched to duplicated behavior that they had learned was associated with such a condition.”⁵⁶ In her book *Hystories*, Elain Showalter refers to this concept as “symptom pools,” whereby certain manifestations of affliction are deemed socially acceptable, while others are *verboten*.⁵⁷ This places intense pressure upon sufferers to produce symptoms which match the perceived litany of complaints associated with an affliction, perhaps even to the point of faking them. Throughout *Hystories*, Showalter makes the case that knowledge of an affliction can contribute to the incidences of that same affliction. For instance, she cites greater public visibility of bulimia as actually introducing millions of young people to the practice in the first place.⁵⁸

Of course, the pressure to “perform” an accepted set of symptoms is not the only type of performance present in human life, and *Sadducismus Debellatus*, like all witchcraft accounts, contains numerous performances. There are the investigators and clergymen performing as they believe rational investigators should perform. There is Grant, presenting the book as he thinks best to reflect his theological outlook. There are the accused witches, who at times accept, oftentimes performatively, the label of “Witch” for their own reasons. Finally there is Christian Shaw, putting on the greatest performance of all, a bravura demonstration of her symptoms for those observing her. Intentional or not, the actions of the various *dramatis personae* in this account reflect the identities which they are always crafting. Much as Judith Butler writes of gender having no “stable identity or locus of agency from which various acts proceed; rather, it is an identity tenuously constituted in time — an identity instituted through a stylized repetition of acts.”⁵⁹

Having established allotrioemesis as a symptom of bewitchment, what are we to make of this peculiar phenomenon? As noted above regarding the creation of meaning and identity, whether the girl believed herself to be bewitched is not at issue. What is pertinent is the fact that Christian Shaw felt the need to conform to expectations of her symptom pool, if she was to be believed, she must therefore demonstrate the same symptoms. The question then is one of where knowledge of these symptoms arose. For his part, Geis believes cases of oral voiding were influenced by other bewitchment narratives, and this certainly could be the case. As *Sadducismus Debellatus* makes abundantly clear, Christian Shaw was literate. This is demonstrated by her reading of scripture during confrontations with spiritual assailants. Furthermore, she did not even need to have read one of the above mentioned bewitchment accounts, all of which precede her

⁵⁴ Anonymous, *A True Account of John Tonken*

⁵⁵ Anonymous, *Great News* p 1

⁵⁶ Golden, *Encyclopedia* p 30

⁵⁷ Showalter, *Hystories* p.15

⁵⁸ Showalter, *Hystories* p 21

⁵⁹ Butler, Judith. “Performative Acts and Gender Constitution: An Essay in Phenomenology and Feminist,” *Theatre Journal*, Vol. 40, No. 4 (Dec., 1988), The Johns Hopkins University Press pp. 519-531

own suffering, to have encountered this particular “symptom pool;” she could have merely heard other people speaking about it.⁶⁰ Finally, there is the possibility that Christian Shaw herself is not the source of the productions at all, they could be the fabrication of the author. Grant could have incorporated symptoms he had read about, or folded in the antics of a stage magician he had seen and deemed suitable for the enlivenment of his narrative. Regardless of the symptom’s provenance, the reclassification of allotriophagy into *allotrioemesis* allows these and other avenues to be explored.

Conclusion

While Golden’s *Encyclopedia* provides an excellent starting point for an overview of European witchcraft, it proves a less than ideal resource when it comes to constructing symptom pools. If such a resource were to be created, the information gathered could be of great use in determining the transmission of societal ideas of witchcraft. Marion Gibson has noted the similarities in witch confessions, remarking that these “stories suggest not factuality but generic representations of witchcraft by witches, perhaps because of the questions asked of them and their need to respond by resisting or cooperating.”⁶¹ The suggestion is that witchcraft confessions are essentially their own genre of narrative. This was possible because those accused were often being led, consciously or otherwise, by the types of questions being asked. These in turn were prone to reflect the interrogator’s preconceived notions of witchcraft confession stories. A similar thread might also be found in regards to symptoms if an appropriate taxonomy were to be produced.

Clarification of terminology is key to clarifying these symptom pools. While it is easy enough for a scholar to substitute common words like “voided” or “passed” for “vomited,” there are less obvious alternatives like “released,” or “produced.” In her book *Findings*, Mary Beaudry points out a similar issue regarding the word “bodkin”: “any early reference to these implements must therefore be read with care and interpreted according to the immediate context.”⁶²⁶³ It is only through a careful reading of original sources, in consultation with historical usage references, that the scholar can hope to uncover the full scope of these terminologies. Not only should this clarification be made in an effort to group synonyms together analytically, the inverse of separating distinct categories should also be pursued. As I demonstrated, the term “allotriophagy” is too limited in its scope, as it indicates the provenance of any foreign object in the mouth as being the work of the victim, who must therefore be suffering from mental deficiencies or physical

⁶⁰ It is worth underscoring the fact that it appears as if the overwhelming preponderance of witchcraft narratives involving allotrioemesis predate that of Christian Shaw, however this has yet to be proven consistently. As I argue in my conclusion, further work must be done on the specific symptom of allotrioemesis in order to trace its development as part of the larger “symptom pool” of witchcraft affliction.

⁶¹ Gibson, Marion. *Reading Witchcraft Stories of Early English Witches* Routledge:London 1999 p 35

⁶² Beaudry, *Findings* p 66

⁶³ Incidentally the above referenced page in Beaudry’s book includes a delightful, if off-putting, piece of historical trivia about an object that appeared to be as much a multi-tool as a symbol of status. Although bodkins are beyond the scope of this paper, I could not resist sharing such a delightful piece of trivia about these forgotten, outsized cousins of the more common sewing-needle: “Those of the mid-seventeenth century can be quite large, sometimes more than seven inches long, sometimes with an ear-spoon or *earscoop* at one end. The earscoop was designed to gather earwax for use on sewing thread, to keep the cut ends from unraveling. Well-to-do women were likely to purchase beeswax for this purpose, but earwax was thrifty and readily available—and cleaning out the ears contributed to personal hygiene.”

disabilities.”⁶⁴ In an era when hegemonic modes of discourse are being challenged, this linguistic assignment of blame is unconscionable. To assume that the sufferer is the only possible source of these objects risks obscuring the exact kind of effect their production was often seen to have: that of surprising and unknown provenance. This is why I have suggested the term allotrioemesis as a substitute.

Finally, much has been written on the psychological and religious implications of early modern witch hunts, and their attendant interaction with stage productions, but there is still ample room for taking the analysis in other directions.⁶⁵ These new approaches are handily suggested when a specific symptom pool is constructed and understood. For instance, in the case of this paper, focusing on allotrioemesis allows for a survey of possible cultural influences upon the given symptom. This in turn leads to avenues of inquiry investigating these tantalizing hints of interplay between popular entertainment culture and the performative aspects of bewitchment. Why do some victims of witchcraft vomit up parades of small objects, while others simply contort and see visions? What is happening in one area that is not happening in others? Could it be the presence of stage magicians producing similar effects, which in turn influence bewitchment narratives and symptom pools? Popular culture has tremendous power to influence witchcraft belief, as noted by Purkiss regarding the early 16th century Miracle and Mystery plays.⁶⁶ This concept was demonstrated at length in Elain Showalter’s *Hystories*. Her conceptualization of symptom pools being influenced by popular culture provides an excellent rubric for the cross-pollination in conceptualizations of suffering.⁶⁷ While it is impossible to prove that performance magicians had an effect upon the symptom pools of early modern witches, there are ways to further explore this hypothesis. Key among them is the study of the relative disbursement of a symptom like allotrioemesis, and the subsequent comparison with the entertainment options available in the same geographic area.

We may never truly know what was going on in the mind of Christian Shaw as she held an entire community spellbound. What remains possible is the illumination to be derived from picking apart the myriad cultural, social, and religious influences that informed the manifestations of her ailment. By training our focus on a specific aspect, we may progress from “familiar objects toward the unfamiliar, guided along, as it were, a chain of flowers into the mysteries of life.”⁶⁸

“Desiring thee to accept of my pains herein, I take my leave.”⁶⁹⁷⁰

⁶⁴ Golden, *Encyclopedia*, p 31

⁶⁵ The final four chapters of Diane Purkiss’ *The Witch in History: Early Modern and Twentieth-Century Representations* is perhaps the pinnacle of this type of analysis.

⁶⁶ Purkis, *Witch in History* p. 158

⁶⁷ In particularly her chapters regarding the mid-20th century cases of alien abductions, 19th century hysterics, and the never-proved allegations of ritual Satanic child abuse in the 1980s.

⁶⁸ Charles Willson Peale

⁶⁹ Anonymous, *The Hardfordshire Wonder*. P 12

⁷⁰ The reader will forgive the author for closing on a quote that demanded inclusion in this text.

Annotated Bibliography
Primary Sources

Anonymous. *A True account of a strange and wonderful relation of John Tonken, of Pensans in Cornwall said to be bewitched by some women, two of which on suspicion are committed to prison, he vomiting up several pins, pieces of walnut-shels, an ear of rye with a straw to it half a yard long and rushes of the same length, which are kept to be shown at the next assizes for the said county.*

London: Printed by George Croom, 1686

- A small polemic. The title contains a list of small objects said to have issued from a sufferer's mouth.

Anonymous. *Great news from the west of England being a true account of two young persons lately bewitch'd in the town of Beckenton in Somerset-shire, shewing the sad condition they are in by vomiting or throwing out of their bodies the abundance of pins, nails, pewter, brass, lead, iron, and tin to the admiration of all beholders, and of the old witch being carryed several times to a great river, into which her legs being tied, she was thrice thrown in, but each time she swam like a cork, afterwards by order from a justice of the peace she was search'd by a jury of women and such signs and marks being found about her, positive oath was given in against her so that she is committed to jayl until the next assizes.* London: Printed by T.M, 1689.

- A onesheet printed in London, again listing a litany of objects being thrown out of the girls' mouths.

Anonymous. *The Hartford-shire wonder. Or, Strange news from vware being an exact and true relation of one Jane Stretton the daughter [sic] of Thomas Stretton, of ware in the county of Hartford, who hath been visited in a strange kind of manner by extraordinary and unusual fits, her abstaining from sustenance for the space of 9 months, being haunted by imps or devils in the form of several creatures here described the parties adjudged of all by whom she was thus tormented and the occasion thereof with many other remarkable things taken from her own mouth and confirmed by many credible witnesses.* London: printed for John Clark at the Bible and Harp in West-Smith-Field near the Hospital Gate, 1669.

- This document contains mentions of items issuing from the mouth of a victim, witnessed by many. In addition to household items there is also a

Rosenthal, Bernard, and Adams, Gretchen A. [eds] *Records of the Salem Witch-hunt.* Cambridge ; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009.

- In contrast to the numerous sources listed in this bibliography, the records of the Salem Witch trials do not include references to allotriophagy. They do reference blood coming from the mouth (Records 391, 428, and 541) as the result of "fits" however. There are also references to when "Cattle would Come out of ye woods wth their tounques hanging out of their mouths in a strange & affrighting manner..." (Record 464) Record 474 references a man having a "tett...in his mouth," obviously a reference to the idea that witches had a special way of feeding demons or other familiars their blood from a sort of supernatural nipple.

Cullen, Francis Grant, Lord. *Sadducimus debellatus: or, a true narrative of the sorceries and witchcrafts exercis'd by the devil and his instruments upon Mrs. Christian Shaw, daughter of Mr. John Shaw, of Bargarran in the County of Renfrew in the West of Scotland, from Aug. 1696 to Apr. 1697. Containing the journal of her sufferings, as it was exhibited and prov'd by the voluntary confession of some of the witches, and other unexceptionable evidence, before the Commissioners appointed by the Privy Council of Scotland to enquire into the same. Collected from the records. Together with reflexions upon witchcraft in general, and the learned arguments of the lawyers, on both sides, at the trial of seven of those witches who were condemned: and some passages which happened at their execution.*

London: H. Newman and A. Bell, 1698

- This document is one of the texts that first directed my attention to what appears to be a discrepancy between the availability of texts explaining sleight of hand, and the fact that many of the "supernatural" occurrences associated with witches could be explained with such.
- This text includes repeated assertions that objects (straw, dung, mud, pins, needles, scraps of cloth) appeared from a young girl's mouth by supernatural means. Nevermind the fact that such objects were commonplace in homes at that time, and could be easily palmed/concealed and secreted into the mouth by any number of sleights.

Cullender, Rose, d. 1665. *A Tryal of Witches at the Assizes Held at Bury St. Edmonds for the Count of Suffolk on the Tenth Day of March, 1664 [i.e. 1665] before Sir Matthew Hale, Kt., then Lord Chief Baron of His Majesties Court of Exchequer / Taken by a Person then Attending the Court London*, Printed for William Shrewsbury .., 1682.

Via: <https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.library.wvu.edu/docview/2240858202?accountid=15006>.

- Yet another account which includes the vomiting of small objects as evidence of bewitchment. This record is another of those cited in Golden's "allotriophagy" entry in the *Encyclopedia of Witchcraft*.

De Heer, Henri. *The most true and wonderfull narration of two women bewitched in Yorkshire who coming to the assizes at York to give in evidence against the witch, after a most horrible noise, to the terror and amazement of all the beholders, did vomit forth before the judges, pins, wool and hafts of knives, &c., all which was done (to make the wonder more wonderfull) without the least drop of bloud or moisture from their mouths : also a most true relation of a young maid not far from Luyck who being bewitched in the same manner did (most incredibly) vomit forth wadds of straw, with pins a crosse in them, iron nails, needles, points, and whatsoever she had seen in the basket of the witch that did bewitch her / as it is attested under the hand of that most famous phisitian Doctor Henry Heers ; together, how it pleased God that he was afterwards recovered by the art of physick, and the names of the ingredients and the manner how to make that rare receipt that cured her.*

London: Printed for Tho. Vere and W. Gilbertson, 1658.

- An account wherein vomiting of small objects is again the primary evidence of bewitchment.

Grose, Francis. *A Classical Dictionary of the Vulgar Tongue*. London: S. Hooper, 1788

- This book also has information on a variety of performance artists said to be entertaining the common folk dating back to the mid-17th century. Grose had a tremendous interest in antiquarian books and papers, which he collated into books such as this. Of particular interest to Grose were unusual performers and descriptions of their sundry performances. Many of his texts bear a resemblance to ethnographies, providing social context and information about the 200-300 years of history preceding his work.

Hocus Pocus Junior. the Anatomy of Legerdemain; Or, the Art of Jugling Set Forth in its Proper Colours, Fully, Plainly, and Exactly; so that an Ignorant Person may Thereby Learn the Full Perfection of the Same, After a Little Practice. Unto each Trick is Added the Figure, Where it is Needful for Instruction London, Printed by and are to be sold by J. Deacon; at the sign of the Rainbow, a little above St. Andrew's-Church, in Holborn, 1683.

<https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.library.wvu.edu/docview/2240873578?accountid=15006>.

- Like Scot's *Discoverie*, this text is an antiquarian source of sleight-of-hand information still acknowledged today. The publication date is once again of interest, a full 15 years before the events of *Sadduceus Debellatus*.
- The notable inclusion of illustrations opens up the possibility that the contents of this book might have been taken in by even illiterate (or mostly illiterate) people seeking to learn the art of subterfuge.

Pepys, Samuel. *Samuel Pepys' Diary*. New York: HarperCollins, 2010

- This is an oft-cited resource for general understanding of the period of 1660-1669. Although Pepys was a well-to-do gentleman with connections to the Royal Society, his observations on ordinary life provide excellent reportage on the prevailing mores of the time. My interest in him is predominantly a reference in his Friday, 24, May 1667 entry regarding seeing the performance of a "juggler."
"But after dinner was all our sport, when there come in a juggler, who, indeed, did shew us so good tricks as I have never seen in my life, I think, of legerdemaine, and such as my wife hath since seriously said that she would not believe but that he did them by the help of the devil."

Pen near the Covent of Eluthery. *A Pleasant Treatise of Witches their Imps, and Meetings, Persons Bewitched, Magicians, Necromancers, Incubus, and Succubus's, Familiar Spirits, Goblins, Pharys, Specters, Phantasms, Places Haunted, and Devillish Impostures : With the Difference between Good and Bad Angels, and a True Relation of a Good Genius / by a Pen Near the Covent of Eluthery*

London: Printed by H.B. for C. Wilkinson and Tho. Archer and Tho. Burrell, 1673.

<https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.library.wvu.edu/docview/2240955207?accountid=15006>.

- Contains reference to “a servant to a Noble man of the Castle of Bontenbrouch, that all the time he was bewitched, he vomited Nails, Pins, Needles, and Strings...” [Page 14]
- Not only was a litany of objects issuing forth from the mouth reported in cases of suspected witchcraft, it was also a recognized symptom of affliction via witchcraft, and included in manuals for ascertaining if such was the case.

Scot, Reginald. *Scot's Discoverie of VVitchcraft proving the common opinions of witches contracting with divels, spirits, or familiars ... to be but imaginary, erronious conceptions and novelties : wherein also, the lewde unchristian all written and published in anno 1584, by Reginald Scot, Esquire.*

London: R. C., 1651

- A well-known text in magic circles which is often cited as one of the first manuals of magic and the subterfuge required to perpetrate it. Rather than a grimoire or collection of spells, this book sought to reveal the methods by which a charlatan could create “supernatural occurrences.”
- The date of this edition (1651), some 67 years after the first publishing, indicates that the book continued to be in some demand during the 1600s.
- Includes instructions: “To eat a knife, and to fetch it out of any other place.” (p.244), “How to pull laces innumerable out of your mouth, of what colour or length you list, and never any thing seen to be therein.” (p. 242) and so on. I might also add that the instructions provided are within the normal practicalities of stage magic.

Vaughan, Thomas, 1622-1666. *Magia Adamica Or the Antiquitie of Magic, and the Descent Thereof from Adam Downwards, Proved. Whereunto is Added a Perfect, and Full Discoverie of the True Cælum Terræ, Or the Magician's Heavenly Chaos, and First Matter of all Things. by Eugenius Philalethes* London: Printed by T.W. for H. Blunden, at the Castle in Corn-hill, 1650.

<https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.library.wvu.edu/docview/2240938932?accountid=15006>.

- A treatise on the history of magicians through the Bible. Could provide information on attitudes toward magic and associated arts during the 1600s.

Secondary Sources

Chireau, Yvonne Patricia. *Black Magic Religion and the African American Conjuring Tradition*. Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press, 2003. PDF via:
<https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.ezproxy.library.wvu.edu/lib/wvu/detail.action?docID=223936&pq-origsite=primo>

- This is referenced in "New World A-Comin" as a source on African American beliefs concerning curses revolving snakes like the one vomited up by Holloway. (See New World A-Comin" pg. 136)

Davies, S "The Reception of Reginald Scot's Discovery of Witchcraft: Witchcraft, Magic, and Radical Religion" in *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Jul 2013, Vol.74(3), pp.381-401

- Since my 499 is examining the incongruity wherein the results of sleight of hand were viewed as supernatural in some circumstances, even given that detailed guides to the practice had been published, scholarship on the reception of these guides is a crucial resource. The simple fact that the information had been published does not mean it was widely disseminated.

Golden, Richard M. *Encyclopedia of Witchcraft : The Western Tradition*. Santa Barbara, California, 2006.

- See Entries on "allotriophagy," "Holt," "Ergotism," "Göldi, Emma," "Loudun Nuns," "Baxter, Richard"

Goodare, Julian. (ed.) *The Scottish Witch-hunt in Context*. Manchester, UK ; New York: Manchester University Press, 2002.

- Numerous short essays detailing the Scottish witch hunts with the specific aim of placing them in context with not only those across Europe, but also in context with local culture at the time. Of particular utility will be Michael Wasser's essay in Chapter 9, dealing specifically with the Renfrewshire cases which were the last in the region.

Jay, Ricky. *Matthias Buchinger "The Greatest German Living"*

Los Angeles: Siglio, 2016.

- Jay's portrait of Buchinger contains much original research into this unusual performer, and as such provides insight into the practices of performance and exhibition of prestidigitation and allied arts during the period of my study. Buchinger was touring widely across Europe from 1690 to 1730, this places him firmly within a single lifetime of the bulk of British Isles' witch trials. This is a curious juxtaposition to me as it would appear that attitudes regarding a person performing seemingly impossible wonders (Micrography, Sleight of Hand, Trick Skittles, Bottled Models, etc.) would only arouse interest as an entertainment, while such feats could simultaneously be seen as grounds for execution elsewhere.

Jay, Ricky. *Jay's Journal of Anomalies: Conjurers, Cheats, Hustlers, Hoaxsters, Pranksters, Jokesters, Imposters, Pretenders, Sideshow Showmen, Armless Calligraphers, Mechanical Marvels, Popular Entertainments*. Farrar, Straus and Giroux: New York. 2001

- Jay is a noted scholar of early modern performance art, one of the few to have pursued the topic with a performer's eye. This book contains additional material on Buchinger as well as other Early Modern Performers and Exhibitions.
- Of particular interest is the profile of Isaac Fawkes, a performer who "produced large quantities of varicolored ribbon from his mouth, 'as if he had a Loom within his jaws.'" (p. 55)

Lamont, Peter and Jim Steinmeyer. *The Secret History of Magic: The True Story of the Deceptive Art*

New York: TarcherPerigee, 2018.

- Most histories of performance Magic tend to begin their study in the mid-1800s with figures such as Robert Houdin, however this book also includes information on performance magic as it relates to witch burnings. This particular intersection of witchcraft (or accusations thereof) and performance magic is not well studied from a psychological perspective (Lamont's speciality), so any resources covering it are of great interest. Most work I have thus far encountered focuses on the religious or mass psychological aspects of witch burnings, rather than their proximity to prestidigitators.
- The bibliography of this book may prove of interest as well.

Leland L. Estes "Reginald Scot and His "Discoverie of Witchcraft": Religion and Science in the Opposition to the European Witch Craze" in *Church History* Vol. 52, No. 4 (Dec., 1983), pp. 444-456 (13 pages)

- This paper presents an alternative, somewhat more negative, reading of Scot's *Discoverie*. The author sees Scot less as a seeker of scientific rationalism, and more as someone who had decided based on theological grounds that witchcraft was impossible and thus sought to demonstrate it through rational means. Since the lack of general reference to texts like Scot's in the broader examination of Witches during the period of my enquiry is of concern, critiques of his work are especially useful.

Sharpe, J.A. "Processus de criminalisation et de décriminalisation/Processes of Criminalization and Decriminalization" in *IAHCCJ Bulletin* No. 17, (Hiver/Winter 1992/93), pp. 15-28

- This paper provides a brief overview of the criminalisation and subsequent decriminalization of witchcraft in England. The eventual process by which such things ceased to be taken seriously by legal authorities is, I believe a good indicator of public opinions surrounding the issue and should prove instructive.

Showalter, Elaine. *Hystories : Hysterical Epidemics and Modern Media*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1997.

- Showalter's book uses literary analysis and medical historiography to chart the rises and falls of various imagined panics in the late 20th century and earlier. This should provide a strong rubric for applying artistic analysis to historical situations as a means of gaining understanding of belief.

Stone, Alex. *Fooling Houdini: Magicians, Mentalists, Math Geeks, and the Hidden Powers of the Mind* New York: Harper Press, 2013.

- Stone provides an excellent synthesis of modern understandings of perception and memory as they relate to close up sleight of hand. This is an invaluable tool for understanding the potential mental states of people viewing and reacting to the results of sleight of hand.