

Portland State University

PDXScholar

Center for Public Service Publications and
Reports

Center for Public Service

4-2015

Examining Reasons for License Non-Compliance among Asian-Pacific Islander Community Members: Project for Oregon Board of Massage Therapists

Masami Nishishiba

Portland State University, nishism@pdx.edu

Lu Pang

Portland State University

Anh Nguyen

Portland State University, annguyen@pdx.edu

Thitisak Duadsuntia

Portland State University

Sirisak Laochankham

Portland State University

Follow this and additional works at: https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/publicservice_pub



Part of the [Public Affairs, Public Policy and Public Administration Commons](#)

Let us know how access to this document benefits you.

Citation Details

Nishishiba, M., Pang, L., Nguyen, A. P., Duadsuntia, T., & Laochankham, S. (2015). Examining Reasons for License Non-Compliance among Asian-Pacific Islander Community Members. Report submitted to the Oregon Board of Massage Therapists

This Report is brought to you for free and open access. It has been accepted for inclusion in Center for Public Service Publications and Reports by an authorized administrator of PDXScholar. Please contact us if we can make this document more accessible: pdxscholar@pdx.edu.

Examining Reasons for License Non-Compliance among Asian-Pacific Islander Community Members: Project for Oregon Board of Massage Therapists

Final Report (April 13, 2015)

Prepared by:

The Center for Public Service
Mark O. Hatfield School of Government
Portland State University

Masami Nishishiba Ph.D., Associate Professor of Public Administration/Associate Director of
the Center for Public Service

Lu Pang, Project Coordinator, Graduate Research Assistant
Anh Phuong Nguyen, MPP/MSW, Research Assistant
Thitisak Duadsuntia, MA/MBA, Graduate Research Assistant
Sirisak Laochankham, MPA, Graduate Research Assistant

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	3
Index of Tables	5
Executive Summary	6
Purpose of the Study	6
Data Collection and Analysis.....	6
Key Findings	6
Recommendations.....	7
Project Background and Overview	8
Massage License Requirements	9
Massage Licensing in Other States	9
Reflexology Licensing.....	9
Data Collection	10
I. Interviewee Recruitment	10
A) Recruiting interviewees from the OBMT list.....	10
B) Recruiting interviewees through community referrals	10
II. Interviewee Profile	10
III. Interview Questions	12
A) Questions for massage practitioners	12
B) Questions for massage clients.....	12
IV. Interview Process	12
Data Analysis	13
Findings	13
I. General Background of the API Massage Practitioners	13
A) Motivations for coming to the United States.....	13
a) Earn higher wages and make a better future for their children	14
b) Reunite with family members	15
B) Educational, professional and immigration background of the API massage practitioners	15
a) Educational background	15
b) Massage training and professional background	16
c) Immigration Status.....	17
II. Where and How API Massage Practitioners Work	18
A) Work at a massage facility	18
B) Work at nail salons, foot spas, and reflexology businesses	19
C) Work in private practice	20
D) Temporary or supplemental job	20
III. API Massage Practitioners’ Perspectives on Licensing	21
A) Learning about licensing	21
a) Many practitioners did not know about licensing before coming to the U.S.	21
b) Obtaining information about licensing requirements and processes	21
c) Practitioners’ concerns about the licensing requirements and processes	22
B) Practitioners’ responses to learning about licensing	23

a) Get a license	23
b) Work at a nail salon, foot spa, reflexology facility, or other business where a massage license is not required	24
c) Practice massage without a license	25
IV. Key reasons for practicing without a license	26
A) Difficulty understanding the licensing process	26
B) Language barriers	28
C) Financial barriers	28
D) Time demands.....	29
E) Insufficient educational background	29
F) Immigration status.....	30
G) Perceptions based on experiences outside the United States	30
a) Massage therapy is not a professional occupation	30
b) Massage therapy is not a medical treatment.....	30
H) Perceptions that having a license is not “worth it”	31
a) Massage practice is a temporary or supplemental job.....	31
b) Capable of practicing responsibly and earning money without a license	31
I) Employers continue hiring unlicensed practitioners.....	32
Recommendations	32
I. Improve dissemination of information about licensing requirements	33
A) Provide licensing information in multiple languages	33
B) Reach out to API massage practitioner communities	33
C) Educate massage clients about licensure requirements.....	33
II. Provide educational support for massage training	34
A) Develop a scholarship-type program for massage therapist training.....	34
B) Develop internship program for the massage therapist training.....	34
C) Develop a multi-language massage therapist training program.....	34
III. Improve accessibility for licensure examination	34
A) Provide multi-language support for the examination.....	34
B) Provide multi-layer licensing credentials	34
IV. Enforce licensure requirements in a consistent and equitable manner	35
V. Develop trusting relationships with the community.....	35
Conclusion.....	36
Resources/Bibliography.....	38
Appendices	39
Appendix I: Project Tasks and Timeline.....	39
Appendix II: Progress Reports	41
Appendix III: Interview Questions	43
Appendix IV: Script for Recruiting Interviewees	45
Appendix V: Informed Consent Forms	47

Index of Tables

Table 1: Interviewee Profile	11
Table 2. Summary of Recommendations	36

Executive Summary

Purpose of the Study

In an effort to improve professional connections with the Asian-Pacific Islander (API) community of massage practitioners in Oregon, the Oregon Board of Massage Therapists (OBMT) commissioned the Center for Public Service (CPS) at Portland State University to conduct a study to achieve the following objectives:

1. To identify any barriers that hinder licensing of Asian-Pacific Islander community members who practice massage
2. To recommend ways to make massage education and licensing processes more culturally responsive to API massage practitioners' needs

Data Collection and Analysis

During September through December 2014, CPS assembled a multicultural project team and obtained approval from the Portland State University (PSU) Institutional Review Board (IRB) to conduct interviews.

- 23 interviews were conducted during November 2014 and February 2015.
- 22 interviews were conducted in a language other than English.

Interview notes were transcribed. The interview results were then coded and analyzed, and key themes were identified. In March 2015, data analysis was completed and recommendations were developed.

Key Findings

I. General Background of the API Massage Practitioners

- Most of the API massage practitioners are first generation immigrants who came to the United States hoping to make a better living. Some came to the United States to reunite with family.
- Their overall educational level is not high.
- Many have some massage training from their home country.
- When they first came to the United States most of them were not eligible to work because of their immigration status.

II. Where and How API Massage Practitioners Work

- Some provide licensed or unlicensed massage at massage facilities.
- Some choose to work at non-massage facilities, such as nail salons, foot spas, and reflexology businesses without being licensed.
- Some provide massage as private practitioners in their own home or the client's home. Most of these private practitioners were unlicensed.
- Some massage practitioners considered massage to be a part-time or temporary job. Some, however, continued to provide massage even after they found a permanent job. Massage became a supplemental job on their days off, or when clients called them for service. Both licensed and unlicensed massage practitioners fit some of these characteristics.

III. The API Massage Practitioners' Perspectives on Licensing

- Most of the practitioners did not know about licensing requirements before coming to the United States.
- Many learned about licensing requirements through friends and colleagues. The information they obtained might not have been accurate.
- Many perceived the licensing process to be too difficult, costly, and time consuming.
- After learning about the licensing process, some obtained a license, some worked without a license at a non-massage facility (nail salon, foot spa, reflexology business), and some practiced unlicensed massage at a massage facility or their own home.

IV. Key reasons for practicing massage without a license

- Many practitioners had difficulty understanding the licensing process.
- Many lacked sufficient English proficiency to pass the examination.
- Some lacked financial resources for licensing.
- Some did not want to invest the time necessary to prepare for the examination.
- Some lacked sufficient education to master the content for the examination.
- Some were concerned about their immigration status.
- Some did not consider massage therapy to be a professional occupation that warrants licensing.
- Some practiced massage as a temporary or supplementary job and did not feel that licensing was worthwhile under the circumstances.
- Some thought they were capable of providing massage responsibly, and did not see the need to be licensed.
- Employers and clients hire unlicensed massage practitioners.

Recommendations

I. Improve dissemination of information about licensing requirements

- A) Provide licensing information in multiple languages.
- B) Reach out to API massage practitioner communities.
- C) Educate massage clients about licensure requirements.

II. Provide educational support for massage therapist training.

- A) Develop scholarship-type program for the massage therapist training.
- B) Develop internship program for the massage therapist training.
- C) Develop multi-language massage therapist training program.

III. Improve accessibility for licensure examination.

- A) Provide multi-language support for the examination.
- B) Provide multi-layer licensure qualifications.

IV. Enforce licensure requirements in a consistent and equitable manner.

V. Develop trust and relationship with the community.

Project Background and Overview

In an effort to improve professional connections with the Asian-Pacific Islander (API) community of massage practitioners in Oregon, the Oregon Board of Massage Therapists (OBMT) commissioned the Center for Public Service (CPS) at Portland State University to conduct a study to achieve the following objectives:

1. To identify any barriers that hinder licensing of Asian-Pacific Islander community members who practice massage
2. To recommend ways to make massage education and licensing processes more culturally responsive to API massage practitioners' needs¹

The OBMT Executive Director and CPS determined that the research would involve interviewing a small number of stakeholders who would include massage facility owners and API massage practitioners. The study was conducted between September 2014 and March 2015 by a CPS team of researchers with multiple language capabilities (Chinese, Vietnamese, Thai, Laotian, and Japanese).

Upon consulting with API community leaders at the start of the project, the CPS team learned the importance of developing relationships with API community members before initiating interviews. The researchers, therefore, took the following steps to identify potential interviewees. First, each researcher attended gatherings of API community members who matched the researcher's own cultural and national background. After building relationships, the researcher asked the API community members for referrals to acquaintances who may be API massage practitioners, or clients of API massage practitioners. The researchers then contacted the referrals to request an interview. During interviews, CPS researchers asked interviewees for additional referrals. Concurrently, CPS researchers requested interviews with massage facility owners and API massage practitioners who were included on a list provided by OBMT.

Twenty-three interviews were conducted in November 2014 and February 2015. Of those, twenty-two were conducted in the interviewee's native language (Vietnamese, Chinese, Thai, or Laotian). Interviews took place at interviewees' homes or another location of their choice. Five interviews were conducted by phone. Some interviews were audio-recorded with the interviewees' permission and later transcribed. Other interviews were not audio-recorded but were documented in writing by the researcher. The researchers translated the interview responses into English before the data analysis.

After completing all interviews, the researchers grouped the responses thematically. Based on analysis of the interview data, and a review of the literature, the CPS team developed recommendations for OBMT.

¹ In this study the term "licensed massage practitioner" or "licensed massage therapist" is used to refer to people who are licensed in Oregon to practice massage. The term "massage practitioner" is used broadly to refer to those who practice massage, but who may or may not be licensed.

Massage License Requirements

In Oregon, it is a misdemeanor for an individual to practice massage without a massage license from the Oregon Board of Massage Therapist. In order to be licensed, an applicant must meet the following requirements:

1. Pass a federal certification test conducted by the National Certification Board for Therapeutic Massage and Bodywork (NCBTMB) or the Federation of State Massage Therapy Boards (FSMTB)
2. Fulfill state-mandated educational requirements
3. Pass the OBMT Jurisprudence exam
4. Pass the Oregon practical exam

Educational requirements for massage practitioners in Oregon include a minimum 500 hours of education, which must include the following:

- Anatomy and Physiology, and Pathology and Kinesiology (200 hours)
- Massage Theory and Practical Application, Clinical Practice, Business Development, Communication, Ethics, and Sanitation. (300 hours)

Unlike some states, Oregon provides one class of massage licensure. Oregon does not accept licenses by state endorsement or renewal.

Massage Licensing in Other States

The stringency massage licensing requirements varies from state to state. All fifty states require an applicant to pass either an NCBTMB or FSMTB test. Overall, Oregon's requirement for educational hours (500 hours) is equivalent to that of California, but lower than that of Utah (600 hours), Arizona and Mississippi (700 hours), and New York and Nebraska (1000 hours). Some states, such as Arizona, which have a higher educational requirement, do not require a state-level written test in addition to federal certification.

Some states provide different classes of massage licensure. For instance, California offers the option to be certified as a "Massage Practitioner" with a lower educational requirement (250 hours instead of 500 hours). Nebraska grants a temporary massage license to applicants who meet all license requirements but who have not yet passed the licensure examination. The temporary license is valid for up to 60 days or until the temporary licensee passes the examination. Utah grants the status of "Massage Apprentice" with reduced requirements. Massage apprentices work under the direct supervision of a licensed massage therapist.

Reflexology Licensing

According to the American Reflexology Certification Board website, reflexology and massage differ, but both help alleviate pain and stress to enhance the health of an individual. Reflexologists apply pressure to specific areas such as the feet, hands or ears, which are believed to correspond with acupuncture meridians that link to various parts of the nervous system. The purpose of reflexology is to improve the function of organs, glands, and other systems of the body. By contrast, massage is used to alter the condition of soft tissue through direct stimulation of the tissue. Reflexologists primarily use their thumbs and fingers to apply pressure, but massage practitioners use their hands (open or closed), arms, elbows and sometimes feet.

Reflexologists in Oregon must meet the requirements of the American Reflexology Certification Board (ARCB) but are statutorily exempt from massage license requirements.

Data Collection

I. Interviewee Recruitment

Researchers sought to interview API community members who are API massage practitioners, API owners of massage businesses, and clients of API massage practitioners. Although the main goal of the interviews was to obtain the perspectives of unlicensed massage practitioners, the CPS team recognized the difficulties in identifying unlicensed practitioners and business owners who hire them. To overcome that difficulty, researchers broadened their search to include members of the API community who might relate the perspectives of the unlicensed massage practitioners indirectly, or who might connect the researchers with unlicensed practitioners they know. Interviewees were identified through these community connections and from an OBMT list of massage practitioners and massage-facility owners whom the CPS Team presumed to be API.

A) Recruiting interviewees from the OBMT list

Researchers called and requested interviews with API individuals who appeared on the OBMT list of massage practitioners and massage-facility owners. Some individuals expressed surprise and discomfort about being contacted. The researchers introduced themselves and explained that the purpose of the study was to identify any barriers to API massage practitioners becoming licensed in Oregon, and to help make the licensing process more culturally responsive. Some individuals also expressed concern that their personal information might be shared with OBMT or other regulatory agencies. Researchers explained that the study is supervised by the university's Institutional Review Board, which requires the team to keep any personally identifiable information confidential. After this introduction, the individuals seemed more comfortable sharing information with the researcher. Six (6) individuals included on the OBMT list agreed to be interviewed. See Appendix IV for the script that the researchers used when recruiting interviewees.

B) Recruiting interviewees through community referrals

In the initial phase of the project, the CPS team was informed by API leaders that the best way to solicit interviewees for the study was to develop relationships with members of the API community and get personal referrals. Researchers shared information about the project with their immediate circle of friends, and contacted API organizations, such as the Thai Oregon Temple and the Asian Chamber of Commerce. Researchers actively sought individuals who regularly receive massage, and invited them to discuss their experiences in an interview.

During interviews, researchers asked the interviewees for additional referrals. (These referral requests are a sampling technique known as "snowball sampling.") Typically, the researcher established trust during the interview, and interviewees introduced them to other massage professionals and clients for interviews.

Seventeen (17) interviewees were identified through community referrals.

II. Interviewee Profile

A total of 23 people were interviewed for this project. Of them five (5) were clients of API massage practitioners, two (2) were massage facility owners or managers, one (1) was a

nail salon owner, and fourteen (14) were API massage practitioners. Of the interviewees, eight (8) were Chinese, seven (7) were Vietnamese and seven (7) were Thai/Laotian. Seven (7) of the interviewees reported that they are unlicensed massage practitioners. Four (4) perform reflexology. Eleven (11) of were female.

Table 1 shows a profile of the interviewees.

Table 1: Individual Interviewee Profile

ID	Background	Nationality	Gender	Valid Massage License
01	Client	Chinese	F	N/A
02	Manager and reflexologist	Chinese	F	N/A
03	Reflexologist	Chinese	F	N/A
04	Manager and reflexologist	Chinese	M	N/A
05	Reflexologist	Chinese	F	N/A
06	Client	Chinese	F	N/A
07	Chiropractic doctor	Vietnamese	M	N/A
08	Client	Vietnamese	F	N/A
09	Client	Vietnamese	M	N/A
10	Former massage practitioner	Vietnamese	F	Y
11	Massage practitioner	Chinese	F	N
12	Massage practitioner	Chinese	F	Y
13	Nail salon owner	Vietnamese	F	N/A
14	Client	Vietnamese	F	N/A
15	Nail salon worker	Vietnamese	F	N/A
16	Massage practitioner	Chinese	M	N
17	Client	Thai	F	N/A
18	Massage practitioner	Thai	F	N/A
19	Massage practitioner	Thai	F	N
20	Massage practitioner	Thai	F	N
21	Massage practitioner	Thai	F	N

ID	Background	Nationality	Gender	Valid Massage License
22	Massage practitioner	Thai	F	N
23	Massage practitioner	Thai	F	N

III. Interview Questions

Two sets of interview questions were prepared to guide the interviews: one for the massage therapy practitioners and another for massage therapy clients (See Appendix III for the interview guide). All interview questions were approved by PSU’s Institutional Review Board.

A) Questions for massage practitioners

The questions for massage therapy practitioners explored the following:

- Their experiences practicing massage therapy in Oregon
- Their background and perspectives on obtaining a massage license
- Their knowledge of Oregon regulations and standards that apply to massage
- Any difficulties complying with licensing requirements
- Any suggestions for improvement

Since many of the massage therapy practitioners interviewed were first-generation immigrants to the United States, researchers also asked about their pre-immigration experiences as massage practitioners.

B) Questions for massage clients

The questions for massage therapy clients explored the following:

- Their experiences obtaining massage therapy
- Their knowledge of their massage practitioners’ license status
- Their perceptions of whether licensing matters in terms of the quality and safety of services
- How they locate their massage practitioners

IV. Interview Process

Interview times and locations were set at the interviewee’s convenience. Many massage therapy business owners chose to meet at their business location. Most of the massage practitioners and clients chose to meet at their homes or a restaurant. Five (5) interviews were conducted over the phone.

Also, when scheduling the interview, the researcher notified interviewees that they would need to sign an informed consent form before the interview, and that the form would be delivered by mail, fax, or in person, at the interviewee’s preference. The forms were made available in Chinese, Vietnamese, Thai, and Laotian. The informed consent forms are included in Appendix V. Interviewees were also notified that upon completing the interview they would receive a \$15 gift card as a token of appreciation for participating in the study.

During the interviews, researchers used an unstructured interview approach in which they followed an interview guide, but allowed interviewees to deviate from the guide and have a

free-flowing conversation. The unstructured approach allowed researchers to engage interviewees in an in-depth discussion about their experiences.

At the start of the interviews, the researcher did the following:

- Introduced himself or herself
- Reiterated the project objectives and why the interviewee was invited to participate
- Thanked the interviewee
- Asked for informed consent and permission to audio record
- Invited any questions about the project

Data Analysis

The CPS researchers met between interviews and also at the end of the full series of interviews and reviewed notes and transcripts, identified common themes and variations, and discussed interview processes. Researchers then coded the interview results thematically to finalize the results and recommendations.

Findings

I. General Background of the API Massage Practitioners

Many API massage practitioners interviewed in this study were first generation immigrants. They came to the United States for a variety of reasons, such as higher wages, a better future for their children, or to reunite with family members.

Upon arriving in the United States many API immigrants found that they were limited by their educational and professional backgrounds. Many interviewees self-identified as not highly educated. Some had been trained and certified to practice massage by their home-country institutions, but the training was unlike U.S. training.

Most of the immigrants did not have legitimate immigration status to live or work in the United States. As a result, they were unable to obtain official employment or apply for a massage license. Some immigrants who had a background in massage therapy in their home country sought employment as massage practitioners in the United States without a license.

Some API immigrants obtained legal immigration status to work, either through marriage or with help from relatives. Even those who were legally allowed to work found that limited language ability and education were barriers to passing licensing exams. Consequently, they practiced without a license, usually as on-call, temporary massage practitioners at massage facilities or nail salons. Some worked as reflexologists. Some worked at home with private clients.

Immigrants' pathways to practicing unlicensed massage are described in more detail below.

A) Motivations for coming to the United States

While individual stories vary, interviewees most often highlighted the following motivations for coming to the United States: to earn higher wages, make a better future for their

children, or reunite with family members. Practicing massage was typically a convenient and available means to achieve their goal.

a) Earn higher wages and make a better future for their children

Interviewees who were immigrants noted that they and others came to the United States seeking better opportunities. Many had heard reports of better-paying jobs in the United States. One interviewee shared that, because he expected to make high wages, he borrowed about \$35,000 from a relative and a bank in his home country in order to come to the United States, but he had not been able to repay the debt yet.

Some interviewees came to United States planning to practice massage, but most came without a clear idea about what they would like to do, or arrived seeking a profession other than massage. For immigrants who had received massage training and certification in their home country, massage proved to be an easier way to earn a living. Some were told by others that, due to their limited language skills, education, and professional background, they could start earning money sooner by doing massage than by doing other work. Some said they felt that they had no choice but to practice massage.

The interviewees noted that they did not earn a lot of money practicing massage in the United States, but the wages were better than back home. In addition, the overall job market situation seemed better and more secure in the United States. Interviewees emphasized that they were not just looking for short term financial gain, but they were looking for a better life and better future for their children.

Quotes from Interviewees

*"What was your purpose for coming to Portland and to America?"
"To America?. . . aha aha ha, just for work and get money."*

"I first came to the U.S. in 2005. After I arrived in California, I looked for a job, and I wanted to be a massage therapist. Actually, I wanted to come for travelling. Someone told me that working in this occupation could make a lot of money."

"People told me that there was a good opportunity for this occupation [massage therapy], and I hoped to earn more money from this job."

"When I was in Thailand I did massage therapy for group tours such as China, Japan. I made some money. They gave money to the guide 120 baht. 80 baht goes to the shop and I could get only 60 baht. I can make more than that here, you know?"

"I realized that my skill and knowledge is not enough to find a good and permanent job. I think that being a massage therapist was a suitable job for me at that time. I didn't have choice."

"First, wage here is higher than my country. I could get some tip from customers. Also, if we think about other opportunities, it is better here."

". . .I actually worked for [a company] in Thailand and I came to America for a conference, and saw some opportunities if I could come here to work. Unfortunately, the business in Thailand was down and had a tendency to close. My job was unsecured and I was concerned about my children's future. I wanted to have a sustained job and earn money to raise my children. They were studying and I

wanted them to finish their school. This is the main reason I wanted to come here and work in massage therapy, I have no choice honestly.”

b) Reunite with family members

U.S. citizens can sponsor family members to immigrate and become permanent U.S. residents. Some interviewees, particularly Vietnamese immigrants, noted that reuniting with family members who had already immigrated was their main motivation for coming to the United States.

Quotes from Interviewees

“(I have been in the U.S. for) 26 years. I came here with my family. My husband was a ‘boat people.’ He came here first and sponsored me and my children. When I first came, my children were very small, now they are both grown up and have their own family and businesses. Our family was separated for about seven months, after that, we reunited.

“I am from Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam. I came to America about four years ago with my husband and youngest daughter, my father in law sponsored us. We have waited for about 11 years to be reunited in the U.S. My older daughter, son in law and grand-daughter are still in Vietnam. I am now working hard (two to three jobs) to be able to sponsor my daughter’s family to go to the U.S.”

B) Educational, professional and immigration background of the API massage practitioners

The API massage practitioners had varied backgrounds. Their educational background, professional background, and immigration status had the greatest impact on their choice to practice massage. The following sections describe practitioners’ backgrounds in more detail.

a) Educational background

Some interviewees stated that they had little formal education. Back home, massage did not require extensive education. Many practiced massage after receiving training that mainly focused on massage skills and techniques. For some interviewees, limited education contributed to limited English language proficiency. Trying to make a living in the United States without being able to speak English was difficult for many of the immigrants.

Many of the immigrants had clients who spoke their language and heard about their massage practice through word of mouth. Interviewees reported that, even when they had English-speaking clients, massage sessions did not require them to converse much. Some simple English phrases allowed them to get through massage sessions with English-speaking clients.

Many interviewees considered massage to be something they could do in the United States with limited education and limited language skills.

Quotes from Interviewees

"I would say that this is the way of life. I am not an educated person; I graduated Pratom 4 (the Thai secondary school). Therefore, I realized that my skill and knowledge is not enough to find a good and permanent job."

"I took a general massage course at Wat Pho (Pho Temple) and took a foot massage course at Ministry of Public Health."

"I was in the difficult time. I cannot communicate with them. I cried and discouraged. I wanted to go back Thailand. But, I have no choice; I have to fight with this problem. I just got a fundamental education from Thailand that was not enough for me to communicate in English."

"I think [being in a massage profession] is good...For anyone who doesn't have much education."

"[Working in the U.S.] is very hard because of English language. Normally, the people in this profession [massage] have lower education, so they cannot do it."

"Well, I don't know what to do. It looked better at that time. I don't have much education. I just know that I could make money from this profession [massage]."

b) Massage training and professional background

Most interviewees indicated that they received some kind of massage training. Some were trained in their home country. Immigrants from Thailand completed required training through institutions such as temples and government agencies. A Thailand massage school called "Wat Pho" was well-known among massage practitioners and clients. The length of training varied from weeks to months depending on the type of training. Short term trainings were typically hands-on, and covered massage that was intended for relaxation only and not considered therapeutic.

Some learned massage in the United States through classes at a massage school, or informally through observation.

Some API massage practitioners were in the massage profession in their home country. Some were in other professions but were attracted to massage in the United States due to previous connections with the profession. For example, one interviewee used to sell medical equipment and another interviewee was a certified nurse. Both of them had some firsthand experience with massage therapy through their former occupation. There were those, however, who had no prior experience with massage but chose the profession because it had been recommended by others, and appeared to be something they could do.

Some of the interviewees who currently live in Oregon were licensed in other states, such as California and Washington. Some of those said that they might not apply for an Oregon license. Some gave the reason that they believe the licensing process in Oregon is more difficult and longer than in other states.

Quotes from Interviewees

"At first, I attended a training course for Thai massage in my home country....It was about ten years ago. It was organized by the Local Government in my community. It was basically for anyone who was interested in becoming a massage therapist and was jobless."

"There was a curriculum provided by professionals from Wat Pho, one of the most famous Thai Massage School in Bangkok."

"I learned [massage] from China and came here and go to school too."

"The first class took 100 hours. I mean the relaxing massage....there was another 100-hour class for therapy."

"I used to take some training courses for massage therapy at Wat Pho in Thailand and I got a certificate from the school. However, it is unacceptable here....It was about three to six months."

"I used to work as a massage therapist in Thailand for about 15 years. I went to massage schools in Bangkok. They are called Ploenjit and Tanomjai."

"They trained me until I became skillful. It took about four week; the lessons were step by step. There were three teachers there. They taught me to get to know about parts of the body and how to do massage therapy until I am ready to work."

"My older daughter actually has a hair shop, I had my hair washed and cut there and also had massage by the worker. So I learnt from them."

"Fortunately, before coming to America, I used to work in [a company] in Thailand. They produced and sold the [massage-related products]. I extensively learned and gained a lot of experiences from being a product's seller. This kind of job has involved in health, general treatment, and bone system including magnet therapy. I also learned the magnetic massage therapy from this company. So, this is the reason why I decided to work as a massage therapist. I think I can use my skill and knowledge that I had learned from them to do massage. Generally, I massaged the customers for free because my main purpose at that time merely wanted to promote and sell my products....Interestingly, my customers were appreciated and liked my massage style. One day people suggested me that why I didn't do the massage job....Finally, I decided to go back to Thailand and take the massage course in there. Then I can come to [the United States] to work as a massage therapist here....It could be my permanent job here."

c) Immigration Status

Some immigrants had permanent U.S. resident status or were citizens through marriage or family sponsorship. Most had immigration status that precluded their employment. For example some had a tourist visa or student visa, or had stayed in the United States after their visa expired. Those who did not have legal immigration status described plans or ideas for obtaining permanent residency or citizenship. As might be expected, those who did not have legal immigration status did not consider obtaining a license even though they were working in the massage profession.

Quotes from Interviewees

"I got a fiancé visa and came here for getting married. I already got a green card and I can do the regular job."

"I come here with student visa. First, I worked in the restaurant and then people suggested me to work in the massage shop."

"Actually, I wanted to come for travelling. Someone told me that working in this occupation [massage] could make a lot of money."

"...there are many Chinese people like me, do like this and work illegally like me."

"I never go out of this area. My boss usually does not allow me to contact with the stranger [because I am illegal]."

"You know I have a better life in America and I don't think I gonna go back to China."

"I will be here and work here....I will be applying for the green card. I have to pay \$5,000 for people who will help me....The government controls people so I don't want to go back. I can use this reason to apply for the green card."

After I got married with an American, I wanted to be a massage therapist because I can help people. I don't have much education. I have been here for about ten years and I have done many things such as at a restaurant, construction, and therapy. I think this occupation is good because I can help people. I think it's good for me."

"I am not an illegal immigrant. I want to have long-term plans for myself, my daughter, and my family. I am not some people, who came to the U.S. illegally and just want to make an instant fortune and go back home. I am staying and I am making a living here."

II. Where and How API Massage Practitioners Work

Some interviewees reported that they practice massage full time at a massage facility (sometimes referred to by interviewees as a massage spa, massage salon, massage parlor and massage bar). Some of these practitioners were licensed massage therapists. Some interviewees work at nail salons or at a reflexology business, and provide massage that is limited to feet and hands. These practitioners were typically not licensed as massage therapists, and many believed that licensing was not required as long as they did not provide full-body massage. Some massage practitioners gained clients through word of mouth and provided services at their home or the client's home. These practitioners were typically unlicensed. Some interviewees described their massage work as a temporary job or a supplement to their primary job. Many of these practitioners reported that they did not see the value of getting a license under the circumstances.

A) Work at a massage facility

Some interviewees reported that they provide massage full time at a massage facility. Some of the practitioners were unlicensed. Interviewees said that the massage facilities provided job security, routine hours, stable income and a steady supply of clients. After working at a

massage facility for a few years, some practitioners managed to own and operate their own store.

Some interviewees reported that the manager of the massage facility handled their scheduling so the practitioners could focus on providing massage. Clients were encouraged to tip the practitioners, and the facility manager would distribute the tips by the end of the day.

Quotes from Interviewees

(Massage Client) "I just go to the massage parlor, and request for someone or was assigned to have massage therapy by someone. If it is good, I would keep the contact info of that person to make appointment for next time."

"I started this business for two years. Before that, I studied and worked for other people. As I said, before coming to Portland, I have studied and performed massage in Seattle for about a year and a half."

B) Work at nail salons, foot spas, and reflexology businesses

Some of the interviewees provide massage at nail salons. Some reported that manicurists occasionally provide massage, and that some nail salons hire part-time massage therapists for on-call services when clients request massage while waiting for their nails to be done.

Reflexology facilities differ from massage facilities. Reflexology is limited to massage of specific areas of the body, such as the feet, hands or ears, and does not include full-body massage. Reflexologists typically are not required to hold a massage license.

Quotes from Interviewees

"I started working at a Pho restaurant at [city] four days a week, and work for free providing massage service at my sister in law's nail salon. At that time my family and I live in their house (the sister in law's), as such I worked for her nail salon without getting paid as a way to pay for our rent. Later, when we moved out and rent a place, I get paid."

"For example,[at the foot spa] for foot/leg, the client will pay \$22, of that \$12 is for nails service (the boss gets \$6, the worker gets \$6), \$10 for regular massaging (the boss get \$5, masseuse gets \$5 for 10 minutes massaging. Basically it is 50:50 for the boss and the worker. That is regular service, for more special service such as hot massage (with four hot stones in each legs), the cost is higher, about \$35 for pedicure, of that \$23 is for 20 minutes massage."

"[at the foot spa] people who do nails can actually do massage also. They gave me work when the salon is too busy. Nail work as well as massage like that is actually not stable, particularly in my case"

as I don't know how to do nails, and I don't speak English. There are days only a few clients come in, I can only do one or two pair of legs."

(On reflexology) "There is no way to survive if they just do hands, feet, and ears massage as restricted by the regulations. [Myself and my] colleagues are aware of restrictions for reflexology massage therapist, they are not allowed to touch clients' body beyond hands, feet, and ears."

C) Work in private practice

Some interviewees reported that they do private practice massage at their own home or their clients' homes. They reported that private practice gave them more time flexibility than working at a massage facility.

These practitioners do not advertise, but instead rely on word-of-mouth and referrals from friends and existing clients.

Quotes from Interviewees

"[Massage practitioners] can go to their customers' home with appointments. Sometimes the customers come to their home, if they become closer and use the service more often. That means the customers and therapists trust each other."

"Sometimes I went to see my client, but sometime they came to see me."

"I don't do massage much here in Portland. But I often used their services. I just called some therapists whom I know well to help me when I get tired from work."

D) Temporary or supplemental job

Some massage practitioners noted that they considered massage to be a part-time, temporary job while they pursued a permanent job. Some, however, continued to provide massage even after they found a permanent job. Massage became a supplemental job on their days off, or when clients called them for service. They stayed in business through word-of-mouth and personal referrals.

Quotes from Interviewees

"I arrived here in 2002. Then I got a permanent job in 2005. Doing massage then became a part-time job. You know? When I first arrived here I cannot speak English I just called Laotian and Thai friends. I had a telephone's list ha ha ha ha! I did not know anybody here."

"Well, I had to work as a part-time at a massage shop in LA without license. It was a part-time job. The owners were very kind to me, and they let me work with them. At first, I was a bit afraid because

I had heard that some illegal therapists had been arrested. I decided to look for a job at a restaurant and I got a job as a receptionist. I just worked as a therapist when I had a chance."

"I tried to do that [massage therapy] for a while, then I got green card and decide to look for other better jobs like waitress, and cook."

III. API Massage Practitioners' Perspectives on Licensing

A) Learning about licensing

The API massage practitioners learned about Oregon licensing requirements at some point in their career. Most of them, however, noted that they did not know about the requirements before arriving in the United States. Once they became aware of the requirements, some practitioners actively tried to obtain information about the licensing process. Some were informed by their colleagues and friends about the licensing requirements. Massage practitioners who found information elsewhere often found it hard to understand. Many decided there were obstacles to licensing.

a) Many practitioners did not know about licensing before coming to the U.S.

Most of the API massage practitioners noted that they did not know anything about massage therapists licensing requirements before coming to the United States. In addition, they were not aware that license requirements vary by state.

Quotes from Interviewees

"I didn't know about that [the license] before. No one told me about that before I came to the US. They just said that I could make money."

"At first, I didn't know about this [licensing requirement]. Someone just told me that working as a therapist here could make more money. However, when I got here, it is much more difficult than I thought"

"Many of my friends and I all have massage therapist licenses in California or Washington. License from California doesn't work here at all."

"Many people have the massage therapy licenses in California and just came to Oregon to practice illegally because they know there is good business here. The owners here have connections, they just need to make a phone call, new massage therapists will be on their way to Oregon."

"I did not know [about the license] when I first visited [the US] and I did not plan or think about working in this career. I just came here for a company's conference....Later, I realized that my massage therapy became popular among Lao-Thai community in Oregon and I got a lots of calls from these customers. So, that was a starting point for being a massager in America."

b) Obtaining information about licensing requirements and processes

Many API massage practitioners who learned about license requirements had searched for the information. Most got their information from friends, spouses, and other massage practitioners. Some looked to manuals, online information, and massage schools or training centers. Some found that the information in English was too difficult to comprehend.

Many practitioners had learned about several states' license requirements. For example, some of them said that the licensing process in California was easier than in Oregon, and that California offered many courses in their languages, such as Chinese and Vietnamese.

Quotes from Interviewees

"Yes, I thought about that [getting the license]. I tried to get to know about the processes. Someone lent me a manual for taking the test."

"My friend told me that taking a massage therapy course in Oregon is very costly and time consuming. I need to spend about two to three years to complete the course and everything."

(Interview notes) Ms. T (massage therapist) said she obtained the majority of the information from her friends.

(Interview to massage therapist/reflexologist. Interview notes.) She went to a Chinese massage training center in California and the curriculum included knowledge about pathology, muscles, and practical exercises. And the training on muscles and the corresponding muscle massage for certain health symptoms seemed important to her as opposed to the pathology. She felt pathology is too hard to comprehend even in Chinese.

c) Practitioners' concerns about the licensing requirements and processes

Many interviewees reported that, after they found out more about the licensing process, they concluded that obtaining an Oregon license would be difficult. The first major hurdle that interviewees reported was their limited English proficiency. The process for obtaining a massage license includes oral, practical, and written tests that require reading, writing and listening in English. Interviewees also thought that their level of education was not adequate for the licensing tests.

The time required to obtain a license also posed a challenge for many of the API massage practitioners. Many of them felt that work demands would prevent them from getting trained for the license. Interviewees' perceptions about the total length of training time required to obtain a license varied widely. Some believed training would take two to three years, while others thought it would take two to three months.

Interviewees were also concerned about the cost of licensing. Perceptions about the total cost of obtaining a license varied.

Many massage practitioners reported that the knowledge required to be a massage practitioner in the United States was very different from that of their home countries. For example, some of them reported that, in order to be licensed in the United States, they had to have medical knowledge of human anatomy, bone structure, and more. They said that, with their educational background, obtaining this knowledge was too difficult.

The API massage practitioners reported that typical American massage clients care more about whether their massage practitioners are licensed or not. As a result, the practitioners

were reluctant to provide services to American clients due to fears that they would get complaints about unexpected incidents during a massage.

Quotes from Interviewees

"Yes, I really want to apply for it [license]. I have talked with Vietnamese friends concerning about language skill, I told them that I cannot read and write English."

"It [obtaining the license] is very hard because of English language. Normally, the people in this profession have lower education, so they cannot do it."

"I don't have the capacity to read all the information online and I don't see any translation version in Chinese. I don't understand."

"I do feel that it [obtaining the license] is costly; however, I am thinking because this is America, and that is American price."

"This is a very small nail salon, only the husband and wife run the business. They are actually afraid too, and very alert, as if it was discovered, they themselves also will be in big trouble."

B) Practitioners' responses to learning about licensing

After learning about licensing requirements, API massage practitioners pursued the following options:

- a. Get a license
- b. Work at a nail salon, foot spa, reflexology facility, or other facility where a license is not required.
- c. Practice massage without a license

a) Get a license

After learning about licensing requirements, some massage practitioners decided to take the exams to obtain a license. Many reported that they did not succeed at the exams. Some tried the exams more than once and eventually passed. Practitioners who obtained the license continued working in the profession as a licensed massage therapist. Some opened their own massage facility.

Interviewees indicated that those who obtained the license typically had immigration status that allowed them to work or study legally in the United States. They also tended to be those with more education and higher English proficiency.

Those who obtained a license noted that their main motivation was to practice massage therapy legally and eventually own their own massage facility. Fear of being caught without a license also seemed to motivate some practitioners to become licensed. Some pursued a license after being fined for operating without one.

Quotes from Interviewees

"Yes, there are only a few [who got a license]. One of my friends could pass the test....Then she opened a massage shop there too. Anyone who has a license can open a massage shop."

"I also have a friend who has license because she is competent in English. She can open her massage shop...."

"I have a friend who took the test four times before eventually passing it...."

"I study really slowly but I have to be realistic, the course is hard and I am trying my best. I don't want to rush the test, but do want to get licensed early."

"In America, at first I were in California, I studied at a massage school for five months (750 hours) in LA. I paid \$1000 for tuition fee. After that I got a license, then I moved to Seattle, to follow a master "Shi fu" in this field. Now I am here because my daughter is studying in Oregon."

(Interview notes) Ms. Z and Mr. W said when they got the \$6000 fine they were astonished and thought it through. They decided it's better to invest money on the education rather than as the penalty. So she decided to go to school since her English is better and their family can only afford one person's education.

(Interview to massage facility owner. Interview notes) One thing that she said she learned was she wasn't aware of the licensing requirement of the facility, "otherwise we could have saved that \$2000, lost \$2000 for a \$50 license, that's stupid."

(Interview notes). Ms.Z used to be a licensed nurse in China for many years and had practiced for many years. She is going to massage therapy school in Oregon, expecting to get licensed in a year. "The massage school is very very hard, I have to spend a lot of time reading and translating what we learn. However, I understand why it's hard; it's for the purpose of protecting the clients. I have some basic medical knowledge from my nurse working experience. Though it doesn't seem to be very relevant to what I am learning now, but it's possibly helpful to my confidence of learning at some level."

b) Work at a nail salon, foot spa, reflexology facility, or other business where a massage license is not required

After learning about licensing requirements, some API massage practitioners chose to work at nail salons, foot spas and reflexology facilities. They provided hand and foot massage as part of their services. Their understanding was that as long as they were not providing full-body massage they did not have to be licensed. Interviewees reported that these facilities allowed them to use their skill set without needing a license. One of the interviewees stated that she worked part time at a reflexology facility whenever she had a chance. She emphasized that she only performed foot massage. Some practitioners who worked at these facilities reported that they performed massage beyond hand and foot massage.

Quotes from Interviewees

"Business owners are looking for reflexology massage therapists who are not required to have all skills trained at school. [Business owners] hope there could be something in the middle that meet

both the regulation requirement and more affordable and feasible for massage therapy and business owners.”

“Chinese reflexology shouldn’t just limit to feet and hands. By this rationale, she [the massage practitioner] thought it’s not necessary to have such strict regulation on reflexology since it’s not supposed to be a medical treatment tool.”

(Interview notes) The massage therapy client interviewed didn’t think any of the reflexology massage therapists were licensed because they believed the reflexology business is not required to have the license.

(Interview notes) The former massage store owner mentioned that no reflexology facility is following this rule [that reflexology is restricted to hands, feet and ears]. For regular customers, their previous “beyond-reflexology” experiences have raised their expectation for the service, sometimes, they ask for more stress on certain body parts. For the sake of returning business, they don’t want to shoo the customers away. Her understanding is only if they don’t do full body massage, they are complying with the OBMT regulations. She also compared the reflexology with manicure. She said that many nail salon workers would massage clients’ arms and even legs. She felt it’s unfair that no one is regulating them as strict as reflexology business.

c) Practice massage without a license

Many API massage practitioners decided to practice massage without a license. Some did not try to obtain a license. Some tried to obtain a license but failed. They were all aware that practicing massage without a license was illegal, and they were somewhat concerned about the consequences of being caught practicing without a license.

Most of the unlicensed practitioners provide massage informally out of their home or at their clients’ homes. They are sometimes hired by massage facility owners on an on-call basis. They get clients mostly by word of mouth. Out of fear of being reported, these unlicensed API massage practitioners tend to serve only API clients. The going rate for the unlicensed massage practitioners was relatively low at around \$10 per hour, plus tips. Some felt the rate was better than what licensed massage therapists get from massage facilities.

Quotes from Interviewees

"I had no license, so I couldn't do that much. I couldn't service Americans, but could do that with some Laotians, Thai people and those who were accustomed to me and Thai massage."

"However, these therapists who have no license don't dare to do massage for Americans because they are so concerned about license and they are very picky and bossy.....They may complain about this and the therapist may be in difficult situation"

"Sure, I still concern. I worry if there might be something wrong with them or they probably know about my license status. Because I do it illegally."

"She[The massage store owner] called me and wanted me to do massage. I always concern about the hygiene. The materials such as towels must be cleaned."

"They[licensed store owners] will hire some unlicensed therapists to do it."

"If the customer was impressed with my performance, I could get more tips. Let's say at least 20 dollars. That means I could make at least 40 dollars per hour. This is about the same rate that professional nurses can do in America."

"So they just do it as a part-time job by getting to know therapy lovers who are willing to help their services. If these people are satisfied with that, they are likely to keep using their services. They can make more money with the tips. Then they get more and more customers with words of mouth. They don't need to have license."

IV. Key reasons for practicing without a license

Unlicensed API massage practitioners and clients of unlicensed API massage practitioners offered the following reasons that practitioners operate without a license:

- Difficulty understanding the licensing process
- Language barriers
- Financial barriers
- Time demands
- Insufficient educational background
- Immigration status
- Perceptions based on experiences outside the United States
- Perceptions that having a license is "not worth it"
- Employers continue hiring unlicensed massage practitioners

Detailed reasons are provided below.

A) Difficulty understanding the licensing process

Many unlicensed API massage practitioners had obtained information about the Oregon licensing process from friends and co-workers rather than through formal channels that presented language barriers. Reliance on informal communication channels may have spread misinformation about the licensing process. Some interviewees believed that the process is complicated, difficult, lengthy and costly. For example, some believed it would

take three months to get a license, while others thought it would take years. Interviewees' estimates of the cost for training and licensing ranged from \$5,000 to \$10,000.

One commonly held perception among the API massage practitioners was that obtaining a license in neighboring states, such as California and Washington, is easier than in Oregon. Some interviewees acquired that perception from people who had been exposed to other states' requirements. Some practitioners moved to Oregon unaware that their license from another state was not valid in Oregon. When they learned about Oregon's requirements, some decided to practice massage without an Oregon license.

Perceptions of the licensing process apparently discouraged many API massage practitioners. Some who wished to obtain the license decided not to apply due to concerns that their investment of time and money would not be worthwhile.

Quotes from Interviewees

"I heard a rumor that mentioned about the complicated and difficult procedures for getting the business license in Oregon. Many people criticized about that."

"As I know, I have to apply and pay for the fee about \$5,000. I have to take the course about two to three years. My American customers told me. I realized that I cannot write and read, how comes?? I cannot do it, right? My problems are about language, law, communication skill, and time constraint. Oh!! When I know about this requirement. I don't think I would take it. Also, I am not a full-time massager I just work as a part-time job. I don't have my own shop. It does not matter for me."

"[In obtaining the license] They will ask about how to do a massage for relax. Also, they will ask about anatomy, which is difficult. Oh, we also had to attend three-month course and pay for the study as well. Then we could take the final test."

"Someone even took the test in California and they could use the license here. They said that getting a license in California is easier."

"No, [I have not thought of applying for the license.] I heard people said so I did not want to deal with it. They said it's so hard, I have to write and read English. Moreover, I have to take a test in English and pay about \$5,000 for taking the course. I have to spend about two to three years in the process. After I got this information from friend. I don't need to apply for a license."

"Yes, I really want to apply for it [the license]. I have talked with Vietnamese friends concerning about language skill, I told them that I cannot read and write English. What should I do? Then, they suggested me to contact with some agencies or schools that can train and teach us about how to get the license. I wanted to ask them about the cost I need to pay, how long I have to take the course, and how about the possibility to get a license if I invest for this course. I had tried to deal with them but finally I did not know how to overcome these concerns. I heard that there were some Vietnamese used to teach a preparation course but I did not know how to contact them I don't know anybody here when I first came here. So, I did not think about it at all."

"[I don't want to apply for a license] because it's too hard to get license. . . . [It's hard because of] language, texts, time, and fee. [It takes] maybe 8 months [and costs me] I don't know probably \$8,000."

B) Language barriers

Interviewees most frequently mentioned language as a key barrier to obtaining a license. Most of the unlicensed API massage practitioners were first generation U.S. immigrants, who knew just enough English to communicate with clients. They did not have sufficient comprehension to take the license examination, which requires the ability to read and communicate technical content about laws, anatomy, and pathology.

Quotes from Interviewees

"Other difficulty is language barrier. Many Chinese immigrants come here couldn't speak English, as such, it is very difficult to pass the Oregon massage license exam."

"I wondered why here they don't have Chinese language program and exam available like in California, New York. Same thing such as driver license, here Oregon also doesn't have Chinese version, but California does have. I think if they make Chinese language more available, more accessible, then more Chinese people will come and invest their business here."

"I think the people who take the test need a translator to help them when they don't understand something."

"If they have a Chinese version [of the exam] or reduce the time to take the course [I might take it]."

C) Financial barriers

The unlicensed API massage practitioners noted that the cost of obtaining an Oregon license is a major obstacle. Many of them estimated it would cost \$2,000 or more for the necessary training, examinations and license fees. Many interviewees reported that they did not have sufficient financial resources for licensing. Some massage practitioners did not expect to remain in the profession. And many who aimed to stay in the profession did not anticipate earning a lot of money by practicing massage. Thus, they felt it did not make sense for them to invest a lot of money in obtaining a license. Their uncertainty about whether they would pass the examination also contributed to their reluctance to invest in licensing.

Quotes from Interviewees

"In the US, the fee is \$1,000 to study, and after that you need to take the exam to have license. For me, I had to take the exam twice, each time \$115. I have license for 10 years and then need to change-renew the license."

"I think the course fee is too expensive. Some people can afford it, but what would happen if they fail the test after study. That means they have to lose both time and money for that."

"They need therapists to take the test. That's in English. It's too difficult for them. How can they pass the exam? They will not spend too much money for that."

D) Time demands

Many interviewees believed that the time required to prepare for licensing would result in lost income, and many needed to work immediately to support themselves. Many interviewees believed that their experience practicing massage before coming to the United States made it a waste of time to spend what they perceived would be eight to ten months to get a license. Also, the availability of job opportunities for unlicensed massage practitioners made the time investment seem less worthwhile.

Quotes from Interviewees

"In China, it would take three years to study massage therapy, however, it does not require full time – every day study, but here in America, you have to study every day."

"I prefer the Chinese way because you don't have to go study every day. And I still can work during school time. While in America, I have to study about five to six months straight (750 hours) full time, and during that time, I am not allowed to work."

E) Insufficient educational background

Many unlicensed API massage practitioners reported that they had no more than a high school education. Their limited education corresponded with limited English proficiency. Also, even though they may have been trained in massage before coming to the United States, their lack of general education limited their knowledge of health sciences required for licensing in Oregon.

Quotes from Interviewees

"It is very hard because of English language. Normally, the people in this profession have lower education, so they cannot do it."

"I am not an educated person; I graduated Pratom 4 (the Thai secondary school). Therefore, I realized that my skill and knowledge is not enough to find a good and permanent job."

F) Immigration status

Some API massage practitioners were illegal immigrants who were unwilling to pursue licensing due to concern that their immigration status would be discovered.

G) Perceptions based on experiences outside the United States

Some API massage practitioners had perceptions of the massage profession that seemed to reflect their experience practicing massage in their home country. Some of these perceptions may have contributed to an unwillingness to pursue an Oregon massage license.

a) Massage therapy is not a professional occupation

Many interviewees did not see massage therapy as a professional occupation. They perceived massage to be something anyone can learn through practice without training. For many of the massage practitioners interviewed, massage was a temporary and transitional job while they looked for what they perceived to be better, more stable jobs. They also believed that being a massage practitioner is not as professional as being a hair dresser, manicurist or caregiver for the elderly.

Quotes from Interviewees

"I did a lot of things when I was in Vietnam including massage. When I came here they taught me to do massage the American way and it[doing massage] is not very hard."

"No. [I don't consider massage therapy as my permanent career.] I want to become a caregiver for the elder. I have skills taking care of my mother in law. I am looking for a job like that, to help older people. First I can have insurance with that job, including eyes, and dental, second the payment is good, up to \$13 for an hour."

b) Massage therapy is not a medical treatment

In the United States, massage therapy is sometimes recommended by health practitioners as an alternative medical treatment, and may be used for therapeutic purposes together with acupuncture, naturopathy, and chiropractic treatments. Among the API immigrants, however, massage therapy was believed to provide only relaxation, not medical treatment. Consequently, many of these practitioners did not see the need for the medical knowledge that is required for licensing. They felt that, as long as they know how to provide massage safely and maintain appropriate physical boundaries, people who have the skills to make others relax should be able to provide massage.

Quotes from Interviewees

"[Massage therapy training is] totally different in our home country because it's not difficult. The teachers teach us step by step how to do and touch to help customers to relax.

"[Although I learned about pathology in massage training school] in practice, I normally won't use what's learned at school, instead, I will simply ask each client what level of pressure do they want, do they have cardiovascular disease, which parts of body shouldn't be touched, where did the client get physically hurt or injured previously. I think it's more straightforward if a customer just pointed at a muscle. I would understand what the client means even with limited language capacity."

H) Perceptions that having a license is not "worth it"

When the unlicensed massage practitioners were asked whether they would consider obtaining a license, some admitted that they would feel more comfortable having a license, and that, if they did have a license, it might open up better opportunities for them, such as the opportunity to own a store. However, for the most part, practitioners said getting a license was "not worth it" for the following reasons.

a) Massage practice is a temporary or supplemental job

For most of the unlicensed API massage practitioners, massage is only one of their many jobs. For example, one Vietnamese interviewee stated that she works in a Vietnamese restaurant on weekdays, works in a nail salon on weekends, takes orders to cook and deliver traditional Vietnamese food to peoples' homes, and provides massage services part-time. She felt, because of its scheduling flexibility, massage was an ideal side job. In general, unlicensed practitioners with multiple jobs felt that the financial and time investment required in order to get a license would not be justified.

Quotes from Interviewees

"Well, it [massage] was my part-time job while I was seeking for a permanent job....When one company accepted me to work I mostly concentrated on my work but I still do massage as a part-time job. I worked in several companies. I used to work about 12 hours per day in one company. My major work definitely affected the massage therapy I did not have time to get orders from the customers."

"I can say that a massage therapy is not my main job so far after I got a permanent job. I worked for a company so I don't have time to think about getting a license."

b) Capable of practicing responsibly and earning money without a license

A number of interviewees noted that they felt confident that they are capable of practicing massage in a responsible manner. They were also satisfied with what they could earn by practicing massage without a license. The payment they receive for massage service in the United States was high enough for them and tips were significant.

Quotes from Interviewees

"It is not possible for me to pass the English test though I believe I am totally capable of working as a massage therapist. I am responsible and has been working in the field for years."

"I can make fifty to sixty dollars for 40 minutes [without being licensed]."

"Working as a therapist here in America makes more money. For example, when I was in California, I got 40 dollars per hour; I gave half of this to the shop owner. If the customer was impressed with my performance, I could get more tips. Let's say at least 20 dollars."

"So they just do it[massage] as a part-time job by getting to know therapy lovers who are willing to help their services. If these people are satisfied with that, they are likely to keep using their services. They can make more money with the tips. Then they get more and more customers with words of mouth. They don't need to have license."

I) Employers continue hiring unlicensed practitioners

Interviews also suggested that some employers continue to hire unlicensed massage practitioners. Such hiring practices, somewhat contribute to API massage practitioners not pursuing licensing. Some massage therapy clients also were not concerned about using unlicensed practitioners.

Quotes from Interviewees

"They [massage store owners] will hire some unlicensed therapists to do it[the massage]. And then they just walking around and getting money."

"No, [I don't ask the massage therapists if they are licensed.] I don't know but I have a conversation and some agreements with her before doing massage....So, I got an acceptable answer from her, then I decided to do massage. I accept that as in worst case, if I might get trouble from the massage, I won't sue them or not even think to blame them because I agree to do so by myself."

Recommendations

Based on the information obtained in this study, the CPS research team identified the following categories of recommendations:

- I. Improve dissemination of information about licensing requirements
- II. Provide educational support for massage therapist training
- III. Improve accessibility for licensure examination
- IV. Enforce licensure requirements in a consistent and equitable manner
- V. Develop relationship with the API community

The CPS team recognizes that some of these recommendations require long term planning and resource commitment. The team suggests that the OBMT take these recommendations into consideration in developing a strategic plan for the coming years.

I. Improve dissemination of information about licensing requirements

A) Provide licensing information in multiple languages

The interviews with the API massage practitioners suggest that many of them are not getting accurate information about licensing requirements. This gap is partly due to the fact that many API massage practitioners lack the language proficiency to comprehend licensing information that is provided in English. Consequently, they rely on informal channels of communication that can lead to misinformation.

API massage practitioners would be more likely to access accurate information about license requirements if the OBMT provided licensing information in multiple API languages, including Chinese, Vietnamese, and Thai. The information should be provided both electronically and on paper.

B) Reach out to API massage practitioner communities

In the course of the study, the CPS team discovered that the API community is a tight-knit group where community members tend to support one another. One of the Chinese interviewees described this community focus as “Zhung zu,” and said that for massage therapy “Chinese clients will tend to go to Chinese shops, Vietnamese clients will go to Vietnamese spas, Korean will go to Korean spas, etc.” API communities trust information and services shared internally among community members.

It is, therefore, important for the OBMT to make an effort to reach out to each of the API communities, and to establish a mechanism for API massage practitioners in the community to share accurate information about the licensing process. For example, the OBMT might want to consider appointing a respected API massage practitioner from each API community to serve as a liaison between OBMT and their respective API practitioner community. The OBMT may also be able to solicit language translation assistance from the API community through their outreach efforts.

C) Educate massage clients about licensure requirements

Some unlicensed massage practitioners reported in the interviews that they avoid U.S. clients because they think these clients are more concerned about whether massage practitioners are licensed. Also, interviewees reported that unlicensed massage practitioners who work at nail salons and reflexology facilities tend to provide massage services beyond what they are allowed to do at those facilities, mainly to respond to clients’ requests. These comments suggest that the level of client awareness of licensing requirements impacts the way massage practitioners provide services.

The OBMT can take an active role in educating and informing the general public and the massage clients about licensing requirements. The general public could be informed of the benefits of receiving massage from a licensed therapist, and could be encouraged to be aware of the licensing status of their massage practitioners. This public and client education effort should be tailored to each of the API communities. Information about license requirements should be disseminated to the API community in multiple languages, using the most appropriate channel for each community.

II. Provide educational support for massage training

A) Develop a scholarship-type program for massage therapist training

Many API massage practitioners mentioned the time and the cost required to fulfill educational requirements as a major obstacle to obtaining a license. To remove these obstacles, OBMT, in collaboration with massage schools, might consider developing scholarship-type programs for massage practitioners who are taking courses to fulfill the educational requirements. Students who receive scholarships could be reimbursed for educational costs in exchange for volunteering services after they obtain their license.

B) Develop internship program for the massage therapist training

Many API massage practitioners suggested that they learn better through observation and practice. It appears that API massage practitioners would benefit from having more interactions with licensed massage therapists, and more opportunities to become socialized into the U.S. massage community. The OBMT, in collaboration with massage schools and licensed massage therapists, could develop an internship program for API massage practitioners who are working toward licensure.

C) Develop a multi-language massage therapist training program

Some API massage practitioners expressed their desire to have a massage training program in their native language. Some of them indicated that there are Chinese and Vietnamese massage training programs in states such as Washington and California.

The OBMT, in collaboration with massage schools and educators, could promote and assist in the development of a multi-language massage therapy training program.

III. Improve accessibility for licensure examination

A) Provide multi-language support for the examination

Many API massage practitioners noted the difficulties in taking the examinations in English and requested the option to take examinations in their native language. They also suggested having translators available for the practical examination.

The OBMT could consider providing multi-language support for examinations.

B) Provide multi-layer licensing credentials

In Oregon, there is only one type of licensure for those who wish to practice massage. One of the interviewees referred to it as a "one-size-fits-all" type of license, and indicated that it excludes various types of massage practitioners who could be effective contributors in the industry.

The OBMT could consider introducing different levels of licenses and certifications such as "massage practitioner" and "massage apprentice" with lesser requirements than the

“massage therapist.” Having a multi-layered licensing structure would allow a more diverse range of people to practice massage consistent with their credentials.

IV. Enforce licensure requirements in a consistent and equitable manner

For most of the API massage practitioners, the fear of being caught practicing massage without a license is a deterrent to remaining unlicensed. Thus, issuing fines for licensing violations is one of the mechanisms available to the OBMT for promoting compliance. A small number of interviewees who actually had experience being fined for noncompliance noted that they were charged a large fine for being unlicensed, and the fine motivated them to pursue licensing. They, however, indicated that they would like to see the enforcement implemented in a consistent and equitable manner.

Some massage practitioners and facility owners seem to perceive that the enforcement is not consistent and there are others who manage to be under the OBMT radar and avoid being fined. They also suggested that authorities recognize the varied impact of the fine for larger commercial operations versus small independent operations. One interviewee said, “The bigger stores are like big animals, you poke them and they feel nothing. They keep doing what they were doing. Small businesses like us, a poke might kill us. We are on the edge of struggling already. It just doesn’t seem fair for us who are working hard for this little business to compete with bigger stores. These penalty policy makes things worse.”

For the enforcement mechanism to be effective, therefore, it is important that the community see that the OBMT’s enforcement effort is applied in a consistent and equitable manner. More information-sharing about the OBMT’s enforcement activities may provide a better picture of how OBMT enforces compliance.

V. Develop trusting relationships with the community

The interviewees—both massage practitioners and clients—recognized the importance of ensuring safe and high quality massage services for the public, and acknowledged the role that the OBMT plays. Yet, there was an undertone of skepticism and distrust toward government in general and the OBMT in particular. It took some effort on the part of the CPS team to develop personal connections with the interviewees before the interviewees became willing to discuss their experiences. Once interviewees learned that OBMT’s purpose for the study is to improve the massage licensing process and make it more culturally responsive, many interviewees started to share personal stories and suggestions.

The researchers’ experiences with trust-building during this study suggest that it could benefit OBMT to make an effort to develop trust and relationships with the API community. Once API communities see OBMT as a trusted partner in making their lives better, these communities can be a powerful ally in implementing policies that would improve the massage therapy profession. One of the interviewees noted that she hoped to see better communication with OBMT. She said, “OBMT should be a regulating authority as well as a public service entity, not one or the other.” While it may be difficult to fulfill these two seemingly conflicting functions, it is something that the OBMT could think about as their challenge for the future.

Table 2. Summary of Recommendations

I. Improve dissemination of information about licensing requirements.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">•A) Provide licensing information in multiple languages•B) Reach out to API massage practitioner communities•C) Educate massage clients about license requirements
II. Provide educational support for massage therapist training.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">•A) Develop scholarship-type program for massage therapist training•B) Develop internship program•C) Develop multi-language massage therapist training
III. Improve accessibility for licensure examination.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">•A) Provide multi-language support for the examination•B) Provide multi-layer licensing credentials
IV. Enforce licensure requirements in a consistent and equitable manner.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">•Demonstrate that enforcement efforts are consistent and equitable.•Share information about the OBMT's enforcement activities to provide a better picture of how OBMT enforces compliance.
V. Develop trust and relationship with the API community.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• It could benefit OBMT to make an effort to develop trust and relationships with the API community. Once API community members see OBMT as a trusted partner in making their lives better, they can be a powerful ally in implementing policies that would improve the massage therapy profession.

Conclusion

Based on the interviews with API massage practitioners and clients, this study uncovered the general profile of the API massage practitioners, how they practice massage, and their perspectives on the licensing process. Their insights helped develop five key recommendations for the OBMT to consider in improving the massage licensure process to make it more culturally responsive.

While the results of this study are informative, it should be noted that the number of interviewees is small and not representative of all massage practitioners or clients. Also, the interviewees only represent Chinese, Vietnamese, Thai and Lao communities, and do not include other API ethnic groups.

Yet, the information captured in this study may be particularly useful because it includes insights from illegal immigrants and unlicensed massage practitioners, both of which are difficult groups to access for a study of this kind.

To gain further insight, it would be valuable to conduct additional research using broader categories and larger numbers of study participants. It would also be interesting to follow-up with some of the interviewees to assess their reactions to any changes OBMT makes as a result of this study.

Resources/Bibliography

OBMT website:

(<http://www.oregon.gov/obmt/pages/licensing.aspx>)

California requirements

<https://www.camtc.org/schools.aspx>

American Massage Therapy Association, State Regulations.

<http://www.amtamassage.org/regulation/stateRegulations.html>

The Core: Entry-Level Massage Education Blueprint

http://www.elapmassage.org/files/ELAP_Blueprint.pdf

Cohen, M., Nelson, H. (2011). Licensure of complementary and alternative practitioners. *American Medical Association Journal of Ethics*, 13(6):374-378.

Sherman, K., Cherkin D., Kahn, J., Erro, J., Hrbek, A. Deyo, R., Einsenberg, D. (2005). A survey of training and practice patterns of massage therapists in two US states. *BMC Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, 5:13.

Stephanie Simon (2011). A license to shampoo: jobs needing state approval rise. *Wall Street Journal*, Feb 7 2011.

Robert J. Thornton and Edward J. Timmons (2013). Licensing one of the world's oldest professions: massage. *Journal of Law and Economics*, 56(2): 376-377.

Appendices

Appendix I: Project Tasks and Timeline

This project started in September 2014 and completed data analysis in March 2014.

The project included five key tasks. They are: (1) Project planning, (2) Data collection preparation, (3) Data collection, (4) Data analysis/Findings, and (5) Report writing. Specific tasks with the corresponding dates are summarized in Table XX below.

1. Project Planning (September 2014)

1. During this phase, CPS project team with multi-language capacity was assembled. The team consisted of members with those who speak Chinese, Vietnamese, Thai, Laotian and Japanese
2. A kick-off meeting with Kate Coffey, Executive Director of OBMT and Ekaette Udosenata, Policy Analyst (September 18th 2014). OBMT and CPS research team agreed that
 - 1) The scope of research population is limited to Portland Metropolitan Area. The initial target for interview was agreed to be approximately 15 massage facility owners and therapists known to OBMT.
 - 2) OBMT provides a list of unlicensed massage therapists and relevant contact information
 - 3) CPS at PSU will conduct a research as a neutral third party and will report the findings without releasing any information that may trace back to a certain interviewees. CPS will obtain approval from the PSU's Institutional Review Board for Human Subjects Research.
 - 4) Potential extension of the project till May 2015.

2. Interview Preparation (October ~ December 2014)

1. OBMT provided CPS a list of key massage facility owners and therapistpractitioners from the Asian Pacific Islander community as potential interviewer.
2. CPS team member met with API community leader/informant to obtain insights about how to approach the API community for interview.
3. CPS team made a decision to include clients of API massage therapists as interviewees, in addition to massage facility owners and API massage therapists.
4. CPS team obtained approval from OBMT to provide gift card as an incentive for the interviewees to participate.
5. Developed interview questions. Created multi-language documents to facilitate the interview process.
6. Applied for PSU's Institutional Review Board, and obtained approval (November 10th 2014) to conduct interviews.
7. CPS team member attended community events and developed relationships with API community members. Collected information on potential interviewees.

8. CPS team members started initiating contacts with interviewees and made appointments for interview.

3. Interview Process (December 2014~February 2015))

1. The CPS team conducted a series of interviews with the massage facility owners, therapists and clients.
2. Continued solicit information of other potential interviewees (i.e. Snowball sampling).
3. CPS team members took notes in the interviewee's native language during the interview. Each note was translated into English.

4. Data Analysis/Identifying Findings (February ~ March 2015)

1. Interview data was analyzed for key themes.
2. Based on the key themes identified, CPS team developed recommendations for OBMT.

5. Report Writing (March~May 2015)

Appendix II: Progress Reports

Examining Reasons for Non-Compliance in Licensing Requirements among Asian-Pacific Islander Community Members: Project for Oregon Board of Massage Therapists

Project Progress Report (Date: Nov. 19th, 2014)

Submitted to: Kate Coffey, Executive Director, Oregon Board of Massage Therapists (OBMT)
From: Masami Nishishiba, Ph.D., Lulu Pang, Anh Nguyen Phuong, Thitisak Duadsuntia, Sirisak Laochankham, Center for Public Service, Portland State University

This project officially started in September 2014. During this time the project team was formed and the interview design was finalized. CPS project team contacted some community leaders to obtain insights on appropriate ways of contacting key informants. Some key interviewees were identified.

Following is a list of key accomplishments and the project progress during September 2014 and November 2014.

Accomplishments:

- Formed project team with multiple language capabilities. CPS project team members consists of the following:
 - Masami Nishishiba Ph.D., project lead (Japanese)
 - Lulu Pang, MPA:HA student, project coordinator (Chinese)
 - Anh Nguyen Phuong, MSW (Vietnamese/Chinese)
 - Thitisak Duadsuntia, doctoral student (Thai)
 - Sirisak Laochankham, doctoral student (Thai/Laotian)
- Mapped the project timeline and specific tasks.
- Applied for Institutional Review Board and obtained approval to conduct interview research.
- Interview preparation
 - Met with Ms. Menglun Chen and Ms. Peng, to obtain suggestions for interview design.
 - Finalize target interview respondents
 - Finalize interview questions.
 - Obtained contact list of massage therapists from OBMT.

- Connect with community members and organization to identify and recruit interviewees.
- Obtained permission to provide gift cards to the interviewees.
- Developed and translated interview documents into multiple languages. Documents include interview questions, informed content, and other information.

Next Steps (November 2014- January 2015):

During the next two months the project team is planning on conducting a series of interviews. Initial key informants are identified. Some snowballing sampling may take place to increase the number of interviewees. We are planning to complete most of the interviews before the end of January.

Appendix III: Interview Questions

Interview Guide (Massage Clients)

0:00~0:10 Introduction

- *Interviewer and note taker introduce themselves.*
- *Thank the interviewee for taking the time for the interview.*
- *Review the purpose of the study.*
- *Ask for informed consent and permission to audio record.*
- *Ask the interviewee to briefly introduce themselves.*

0:10~0:15 Massage experience

1. *Please tell us about your massage experience. How often do you get massage? What are the primary reasons for you to get massage?*

0:15~0:25 Assessment of the massage therapist

2. *Please tell us about your massage therapist. Are you happy with the quality and the price range of your massage therapists? How is the massage done? Is the store busy? Is it hard to get the appointment?*
3. *Do you know if your massage therapists are licensed or not? Do you care? If yes, why? If no, why?*

0:25~0:45 Massage therapists' story

4. *Do you know the background of your massage therapists, such as his/her nationality or ethnic origin?*
5. *Can you share any interesting stories about your massage therapists?*

0:45~0:50 Wrap-up

6. *Do you have any questions for us? Do you have anyone you think would be interested in talking with us? Do you think you can introduce us to your massage therapists to participate in the interview?*
- Thank the interviewee.
 - Take care of the transportation reimbursement.

Interview Guide (Massage Therapists)

0:00~0:10 Introduction

- *Interviewer and note taker introduce themselves.*
- *Thank the interviewee for taking the time for the interview.*
- *Review the purpose of the study.*
- *Ask for informed consent and permission to audio record.*
- *Ask the interviewee to briefly introduce themselves.*

0:10~0:20 Becoming a massage therapist

7. *Please tell us how you became a massage therapist. What attracted you to massage therapist as a profession?*

0:20~0:30 Being a massage therapist in Oregon/US.

8. *How do you like being a massage therapist in Portland Oregon? What are the differences between here and your home country and/or other places in the US?*

0:30~0:45 Licensing process

9. *Are you aware of the licensing requirements in Oregon?*

[If YES]

3a. *Tell us about your experience and/or observations about the licensing process. What are the things that you like? What are the things that you don't like?*

3b. *What do you think we can do to make the licensing process easier for the Asian Pacific Islander massage therapists?*

[If NO]

3c. *Would you like to know about the process? [If yes, provide brief description of the licensing process].*

3d. *After hearing about the process, what do you think about it? Would you consider being licensed?*

3e. *What do you think we can do to make the licensing process easier for the Asian Pacific Islander massage therapists.*

0:45~0:50 Wrap-up

10. *Do you have any questions for us? Do you have anyone you think would be interested in talking with us?*

- Thank the interviewee.
- Take care of the transportation reimbursement.

Appendix IV: Script for Recruiting Interviewees

Script for Recruiting Massage Therapists/Clients for Interview (Phone)

Hello:

My name is [Name of the caller/research team member], from the Hatfield School of Government at Portland State University. I got your phone number from [organization provided the information.] How are you doing today? Do you have a moment to talk with me about our research?

I am a member of a research team from Portland State University. We are conducting a study relating to the massage therapist profession and we would like to have your input. We are especially interested in hearing your experience in becoming a professional massage therapist, some difficulties or challenges along the way.

The interview will take approximately 45 to 50 minutes. We can meet at the location of your choice. If you prefer to meet with us at Portland State University we have a room available where you can have your privacy. Also, as a way to express our gratitude for your participation to the study, we will present you with a \$20 gift certificate at the end of the interview.

If you are interested and available to meet with us for the interview, we will send you more information about the study and the interview process in writing either by email or by mail.

Will you be interested in receiving more information about the study? Do you have any questions about the study at this point?

[Take questions. Obtain email or physical address if the person request for information on the study]

Thank you very much for your time. We will send you the information and will follow-up with you to see if you would like to schedule an interview. We can discuss the time and place at that point. Would you prefer us to contact you by phone or email?

Thanks again, and if you have any questions, please call me at XXX (Phone number)

Have a good day.

Script for Recruiting Massage Therapists/Clients for Interview (E-mail)

Dear XX,

Hope this message finds you well.

[If this is a follow-up after meeting with this person at other network events]
It was nice seeing you at the XXX meeting on [date]. As I mentioned briefly in our conversation I am with a group of researcher at the Hatfield School of Government at Portland State University who are conducting a study relating to the massage therapist profession.

[If this is a new contact being referred by others in the community]
My name is [Name of the research team member], from the Hatfield School of Government at Portland State University. I am with a group of researcher at the Hatfield School who are conducting a study relating to the massage therapist profession. I got your email address from [organization provided the information], who told us that you would be a good person to contact in relations to the study.

We are studying the experience of Asian Pacific Islander massage therapists in becoming a professional in Oregon. We learned that you have a firsthand knowledge about the Asian Pacific Islander massage therapists, and we are wondering if you would be willing to share [for the massage therapists] your story as a massage therapist in Oregon. /[for the massage client] the stories of the Asian Pacific Islander massage therapists you know of.

The interview will take approximately 45 to 50 minutes. We can meet at the location of your choice. If you prefer to meet with us at Portland State University we have a room available where you can have your privacy. Also, as a way to express our gratitude for your participation to the study, we will present you with a \$20 gift certificate at the end of the interview.

If you are interested and available to meet with us for the interview, we will send you more information about the study and the interview process in writing in a follow-up email.

We appreciate if you could let us know if you would be interested in participating in this study. Thank you, and please feel free to contact me by email or by phone (phone number) if you have any questions about the study.

Looking forward to hearing from you.

Best.

XXX

Appendix V: Informed Consent Forms

Human Subjects Research Review Committee
Research and Strategic Partnerships
<http://www.pdx.edu/research/>



The Portland State University
Consent to Participate in Research
*Becoming a Massage Therapists in Oregon: Examining Asian Pacific Islander Massage
Therapists' Professionalization Process*

October 13, 2014

Introduction

You are being asked to participate in a research study that is being done by Masami Nishishiba, Ph.D. who is the Principal Investigator and Lu Pang, Anh Phuong Nguyen, Thitisak Duadsuntia, and Sirisak Laochankham from the Hatfield School of Government at Portland State University in Portland, Oregon. This research is studying the professionalization process of the Asian Pacific Islander massage therapists.

You are being asked to participate in this study because you have some experience and knowledge about the Asian Pacific Islander massage therapists, and you have indicated your interest in sharing your insight with us.

This form will explain the research study, and will also explain the possible risks as well as the possible benefits to you. We encourage you to talk with your family and friends before you decide to take part in this research study. If you have any questions, please ask one of the study investigators.

What will happen if I decide to participate?

If you agree to participate, the following things will happen:

We will determine a place and time for us to meet for the interview. You can choose the most convenient place for you to have the interview. Should you wish to have an interview at Portland State University, we will arrange a small conference room in the Urban Center Building at Portland State University for the interview.

How long will I be in this study?

Participation in this study will take a total of 45 to 50 minutes for one session of the interview.

What are the risks or side effects of being in this study?

There are risks of stress, emotional distress, inconvenience and possible loss of privacy and confidentiality associated with participating in a research study.

If the interview questions make you feel stressed or uncomfortable, please feel free to express your feeling to the interviewer. You can refrain from answering any questions. You can also decide to withdraw from the interview at any time.

In order to avoid any inconvenience or loss of privacy, we would like to conduct the interview at the location of your choice. Please let us know the most convenient place for you. As we mentioned earlier, we can also arrange a room at Portland State University.

For more information about risks and discomforts, please ask the interviewer.

What are the benefits to being in this study?

It is unlikely that you will benefit directly from participating in this study. But your input in this study will help improve the massage therapists' professionalization process more culturally relevant, and will improve the implementation of the licensing procedure. Your participation will contribute in helping those in the Asian Pacific Islander community who are pursuing becoming massage therapists. The general public will also benefit from having more skilled and safe-services from the licensed practice therapists.

How will my information be kept confidential?

We will take measures to protect the security of all your personal information, but we cannot guarantee confidentiality of all study data.

In order to maximize the confidentiality of the study data, we will make sure that any information that is obtained in connection with this study and that can be linked to you or identify will only be accessed by the research team member. Your contact information, interview notes, audio recording and transcript of the interview will be saved in a secure place with access restricted only to the researcher. When the recording is transcribed names will be altered and other identifying information will be deleted to preserve anonymity.

Information contained in your study records is used by study staff. The Portland State University Institutional Review Board (IRB) that oversees human subject research and/or other entities may be permitted to access your records, and there may be times when we are required by law to share your information. It is the investigator's legal obligation to report

child abuse, child neglect, elder abuse, harm to self or others or any life-threatening situation to the appropriate authorities, and; therefore, your confidentiality will not be maintained.

Your name will not be used in any published reports about this study.

Will I be paid for taking part in this study?

Upon completion of the interview, we will provide you with a \$15 gift card. Other than that, you will not be paid for taking part in this study. We will, however, reimburse you with the cost associated with the transportation required for you to be at the interview site.

Can I stop being in the study once I begin?

Your participation in this study is completely voluntary. You have the right to choose not to participate or to withdraw your participation at any point in this study without penalty or loss of benefits to which you are otherwise entitled.

Whom can I call with questions or complaints about this study?

If you have any questions, concerns or complaints at any time about the research study, Masami Nishishiba or Lu Pang will be glad to answer them at 503-449-8192/503-754-4984.

You can contact them after business hours or on weekends at the cell phone number above.

Whom can I call with questions about my rights as a research participant?

If you have questions regarding your rights as a research participant, you may call the PSU Office for Research Integrity at (503) 725-2227 or 1(877) 480-4400. The ORI is the office that supports the PSU Institutional Review Board (IRB). The IRB is a group of people from PSU and the community who provide independent oversight of safety and ethical issues related to research involving human participants. For more information, you may also access the IRB website at <https://sites.google.com/a/pdx.edu/research/integrity>.

CONSENT

You are making a decision whether to participate in this study. Your signature below indicates that you have read the information provided (or the information was read to you). By signing this consent form, you are not waiving any of your legal rights as a research participant.

You have had an opportunity to ask questions and all questions have been answered to your satisfaction. By signing this consent form, you agree to participate in this study. A copy of this consent form will be provided to you.

Name of Adult Subject (print)

Signature of Adult Subject

Date

INVESTIGATOR SIGNATURE

This research study has been explained to the participant and all of his/her questions have been answered. The participant understands the information described in this consent form and freely consents to participate.

Name of Investigator/ Research Team Member (type or print)

(Signature of Investigator/ Research Team Member)

Date

มหาวิทยาลัยพุดแลนด์
ใบอนุญาตเข้าร่วมการวิจัย
เรื่อง การเป็นหมอนวดในรัฐออเรกอน:
ศึกษาระบวนการเป็นหมอนวดมืออาชีพของคนเอเชียและชาวเกาะในแปซิฟิก
๑๓ ตุลาคม ๒๕๕๘

คำนำ

ท่านได้รับการร้องขอให้เข้าร่วมการศึกษาวิจัย ซึ่งดำเนินการโดย ดร. มาซามิ นิชิชิบะ
ในฐานะหัวหน้าคณะผู้วิจัย นางสาวลู ปัง นางแอนู เฟื่อง เหวียน นายธิตศักดิ์ เต็ดดสันเทีย
และ นายศิริศักดิ์ เหล่าจันทาม จาก ภาควิชาการปกครอง แสทฟิวอนุสรณ์ มหาวิทยาลัยพุดแลนด์
เอ มี อ ง พ อ ต แ ล น ด์ ร ัฐ อ อ เ ร ก อ น
การศึกษานี้มุ่งศึกษาระบวนการเป็นหมอนวดมืออาชีพของชาวเอเชียและชาวเกาะในทะเลแปซิฟิก

การที่ท่านได้รับการร้องขอให้ร่วมการวิจัยในครั้งนี้
เนื่องจากเราพิจารณาเห็นว่าท่านเป็นผู้มีประสบการณ์และความรู้เกี่ยวกับการประกอบอาชีพนวดของชาวเอ
เซียและชาวเกาะในทะเลแปซิฟิก และท่านได้ให้ความสนใจที่จะแลกเปลี่ยนข้อมูลกับพวกเรา

ใบอนุญาตเข้าร่วมการวิจัยนี้จะอธิบายเกี่ยวกับการศึกษาวิจัย
และจะอธิบายถึงความเสี่ยงและประโยชน์ที่ท่านจะได้รับ
พวกเราอยากให้คุณได้พูดคุยกับครอบครัวหรือเพื่อนของท่านก่อนที่ท่านจะตัดสินใจเป็นส่วนหนึ่งของการวิ
จัยนี้ หากท่านมีคำถาม โปรดสอบถามหนึ่งในคณะผู้วิจัยของเราได้

จะเกิดอะไรขึ้นถ้าหากฉันตัดสินใจเข้าร่วมการศึกษาวิจัย?

ถ้าคุณตัดสินใจเข้าร่วมการศึกษาวิจัยนี้ จะมีกระบวนการและขั้นตอนต่างๆ เหล่านี้เกิดขึ้น

พวกเราจะตกลงกันเกี่ยวกับสถานที่และเวลาที่จะนัดพบ สำหรับการให้สัมภาษณ์
ท่านสามารถเลือกสถานที่ที่คิดว่าท่านสะดวกที่สุดในการให้สัมภาษณ์

หากท่านสะดวกที่จะมาให้สัมภาษณ์ที่มหาวิทยาลัยพอตแลนด์ เราจะอำนวยความสะดวกจัดห้องประชุมไว้ในการสัมภาษณ์ที่ อาคารศูนย์ชุมชนเมือง มหาวิทยาลัยพอตแลนด์

ระยะเวลาที่ฉันจะต้องอยู่ร่วมการศึกษานี้นานเท่าไร?

การเข้าร่วมการศึกษาวิจัยนี้ ใช้เวลาทั้งสิ้นประมาณ ๔๕-๕๐ นาที ต่อรอบการสัมภาษณ์

อะไรคือความเสี่ยงหรือผลกระทบที่อาจจะเกิดขึ้นในการศึกษานี้?

อาจมีความเสี่ยงที่จะเกิดภาวะตึงเครียด อารมณ์หงุดหงิด ความรู้สึกอึดอัด ไม่เป็นส่วนตัว ขาดความมั่นใจที่จะเข้าร่วมการศึกษาวิจัย ถ้าหากคำถามในการวิจัยทำให้ท่านรู้สึกเครียดหรืออึดอัด โปรดกรุณาแจ้งต่อผู้สัมภาษณ์ ท่านสามารถปฏิเสธที่จะตอบคำถามได้ทุกคำถาม และท่านสามารถยุติการให้สัมภาษณ์ได้ตลอดเวลา

เพื่อหลีกเลี่ยงความอึดอัดหรือขาดความเป็นส่วนตัว เราจึงสัมภาษณ์ท่านตามสถานที่ที่ท่านสะดวก โปรดแจ้งสถานที่ดังกล่าวให้เราทราบต่อไป จากที่กล่าวมาแล้วข้างต้น เราสามารถจัดห้องสัมภาษณ์ให้ท่านได้ที่มหาวิทยาลัยพอตแลนด์

หากต้องการสอบถามข้อมูลเพิ่มเติมเกี่ยวกับความเสี่ยงและความไม่สะดวก โปรดสอบถามผู้สัมภาษณ์

อะไรที่จะเป็นประโยชน์ในการศึกษาวิจัยนี้?

การศึกษานี้ อาจจะถูกมองว่าไม่ได้เป็นประโยชน์โดยตรงต่อท่านเสียทีเดียว แต่ ข้อมูลที่ท่านให้กับการศึกษานี้ จะช่วยในการพัฒนาและยกระดับกระบวนการเป็นหมอนวดแบบมีอาชีพที่เข้ากับสภาพของวัฒนธรรมและพัฒนากระบวนการขั้นตอนการได้ใบอนุญาต การเข้าร่วมของท่านในครั้งนี้ จะเป็นการช่วยชุมชนชาวเอเชียและชาวเกาะแปซิฟิกผู้ที่ต้องการจะประกอบอาชีพนวด

ในขณะที่สังคมส่วนรวมก็จะได้ประโยชน์จากการมีหมวดที่มีทักษะและการบริการที่ปลอดภัยจากหมวด
ดได้รับใบอนุญาต

ข้อมูลที่เราให้ไปนี้จะเก็บเป็นข้อมูลส่วนตัวได้อย่างไร?

เราจะมีมาตรการปกป้องข้อมูลส่วนตัวของท่านที่เราไว้ทุกประการ
แต่เราไม่สามารถรับประกันถึงข้อมูลทั้งหมดจากการศึกษา

เพื่อที่จะรับรองข้อมูลส่วนบุคคลขั้นสูงสุด เรามั่นใจว่า ข้อมูลที่เราได้รับจากการศึกษา
จะมีเพียงคณะผู้วิจัยเท่านั้นที่จะสามารถเข้าถึงข้อมูลนี้ได้ ข้อมูลที่อยู่ การติดต่อ การจดบันทึก
การอัดเสียงสัมภาษณ์ และการถอดเทปสัมภาษณ์ จะถูกเก็บไว้ในที่ปลอดภัย
และเข้มงวดให้เฉพาะคณะผู้วิจัยเท่านั้นที่จะเข้าถึงข้อมูลได้ เมื่อมีการถอดเทปสัมภาษณ์
ชื่อที่ปรากฏในรายงานการถอดเทปจะถูกเปลี่ยน
รวมถึงข้อมูลส่วนตัวทั้งหมดจะถูกถอดออกเพื่อเป็นการปกป้องข้อมูลส่วนบุคคล

ข้อมูลที่บันทึกในการรายงานการศึกษาที่ถูกใช้โดยคณะผู้วิจัย
คณะกรรมการการศึกษาวิจัยในมนุษย์และองค์กรที่เกี่ยวข้องกับการศึกษาวิจัยของมหาวิทยาลัยพอดแลนด์
จะได้รับอนุญาตให้เข้าถึงข้อมูลนี้ได้ ซึ่งอาจจะมีบางครั้งที่เราต้องแลกเปลี่ยนข้อมูลนี้กับหน่วยงานที่เกี่ยวข้อง
ภายใต้กฎหมาย
ถือว่าเป็นข้อบังคับของคณะผู้วิจัยที่จะต้องรายงานไปยังหน่วยงานที่เกี่ยวข้องหากพบกรณีการทารุณกรรม
เด็ก เด็กถูกทอดทิ้ง การทารุณกรรมผู้สูงอายุ ที่จะเป็นภัยต่อตัวเราและผู้อื่น
รวมถึงการปกป้องชีวิตในสถานการณ์จำเป็น
ฉะนั้นหากมีกรณีเช่นนี้ข้อมูลส่วนตัวของท่านจะไม่ได้รับการปกปิด

เราจะไม่ใช่ชื่อของท่านในการทำรายงานหรือเผยแพร่ต่อสาธารณะอันเกี่ยวกับการศึกษา

ฉันจะได้รับค่าใช้จ่ายอะไรในการศึกษา?

หากการสัมภาษณ์นี้สมบูรณ์ เราจะมีบัตรสมนาคุณให้ท่าน ๑ บัตร ราคา ๑๕ ดอลลาร์
นอกเหนือจากนี้ท่านจะไม่ได้รับค่าใช้จ่ายใดๆ สำหรับการให้สัมภาษณ์นี้
หากคุณจำเป็นต้องเดินทางมาให้สัมภาษณ์ เราสามารถเบิกค่ายานพาหนะให้ท่านได้

ฉันสามารถยกเลิกการร่วมการศึกษาครั้งนี้หลังจากการสัมภาษณ์ได้เริ่มขึ้นแล้วได้หรือไม่
การร่วมในการศึกษานี้เป็นไปตามความสมัครใจของท่าน
ท่านมีสิทธิ์ที่จะเลือกไม่ร่วมหรือยกเลิกการร่วมได้ทันที
โดยไม่มีบทลงโทษหรือไม่กระทบต่อกิจการหรือชื่อเสียงของท่าน

ท่านสามารถติดต่อเพื่อสอบถามหรือส่งข้อร้องเรียนเกี่ยวกับการศึกษานี้ได้ไปที่ใคร

หากท่านมีคำถาม ข้อห่วงใย หรือ ร้องเรียน เกี่ยวกับการศึกษา ท่านสามารถติดต่อที่ ดร.มาซามิ นิชิชิบะ หรือ คุณลู พัง ทั้งสองท่านยินดีตอบคำถามและให้ข้อมูล โทรศัพท์ ๕๐๓-๔๔๙ ๘๑๙๒ หรือ ๕๐๓-๗๕๔-๔๙๘๔
ท่านติดต่อบุคคลทั้งสองได้หลังจากเวลาเลิกงาน หรือ วันหยุดสุดสัปดาห์ ตามเบอร์ข้างต้น

หน่วยงานใดที่ฉันสามารถติดต่อสอบถามได้เกี่ยวกับสิทธิ์ส่วนบุคคลในฐานะผู้ร่วมการวิจัย

หากท่านมีคำถามเกี่ยวกับสิทธิ์ในฐานะผู้ร่วมการวิจัย ท่านสามารถติดต่อ the PSU Office for Research Integrity at (503) 725-2227 or 1(877) 480-4400 สำนักงานนี้จะเป็นหน่วยงานสนับสนุน the PSU Institutional Review Board (IRB) หน่วยงาน IRB เป็นคณะบุคคลจาก PSU และจากประชาคมเครือข่ายที่รับผิดชอบความปลอดภัยและจริยธรรมการวิจัยในมนุษย์ ติดต่อสอบถามหรือหาข้อมูลเพิ่มเติมได้ที่ <https://sites.google.com/a/pdx.edu/research/integrity>

แสดงความจำนงอนุญาตร่วมการวิจัย

ท่านได้ตัดสินใจจะเข้าร่วมในการวิจัย ลายมือชื่อของท่านด้านล่างนี้ ยืนยันว่าท่านได้อ่านข้อมูลข้างต้นแล้ว การลงลายมือชื่อนี้ ไม่กระทบต่อสิทธิ์ตามกฎหมายของท่านในฐานะผู้ร่วมการวิจัย

ท่านมีโอกาสนในการสอบถามข้อมูล คำถาม จนกว่าท่านจะพึงพอใจ การลงลายมือชื่อในแบบฟอร์มนี้
ท่านยินดีร่วมในการศึกษานี้ สำเนาใบอนุญาตนี้ จะเก็บไว้ที่ท่าน ๑ ฉบับ

ชื่อของผู้ร่วมวิจัย (ตัวเขียน)

ลายมือชื่อ

วันที่

ลายมือชื่อผู้วิจัย

ผู้วิจัยได้อธิบายรายละเอียดต่างๆ เกี่ยวกับการศึกษาวิจัยแก่ผู้ร่วมการวิจัยไว้อย่างครบถ้วน โดยไม่มีคำถามใดๆ เพิ่มเติม ผู้ร่วมการวิจัยเข้าใจและรับทราบข้อมูลที่ได้ระบุและอธิบายไว้ในแบบฟอร์มนี้ และยินดีที่จะร่วมการวิจัยในครั้งนี้

ลายชื่อผู้วิจัย (ตัวเขียน)

(ลายมือชื่อผู้วิจัย)

วันที่

波特兰州立大学

参与研究知情同意书

“在俄勒冈州成为一名按摩治疗师：检视亚洲及太平洋岛民按摩治疗师职业化过程”

简介

您被邀请参与本项研究，雅美西芝博士任本项研究的首席研究员。逢璐，阮芳映以及 Thitisak Duadsuntia 和 Sirisak Laochankham 为波特兰州立大学哈特菲尔德政府学院的研究生。本项研究旨在探究亚洲以及太平洋岛民（API）按摩治疗师职业化过程。

您之所以被邀请参与本项研究，是因为您有与 API 相关的经验或知识，并且您也表示愿与我们分享您的观点。

本知情书会向您解释本此研究内容，同时也会介绍对您可能带来的风险以及利益。我们鼓励您和家人及朋友充分交流以决定是否参与本项研究。如有问题，请咨询我们的研究员。

如果我决定参与本次研究，会怎样？

如果你同意参与，以下的事情会发生：

我们会确定一个面谈的时间和地点。您可以选择对您最方便的面谈地点。如果您希望在波特兰州立大学校园内进行面谈，我们会安排一间小会议室，会议室将位于波特兰州立大学公共规划与公共事务大楼。

本项研究会持续多久？

参与本项研究将花费一次 40 到 50 分钟的面试。

参与本项研究会带来什么风险和副作用？

可能存在的风险包括压力，精神压抑，不舒服以及由于参与研究可能带来的隐私和保密性的损失。

如果面谈问题让您觉得有压力或者不舒服，请告知研究员，表达您的感受。您可以不回答任何问题。您也可以随时退出面谈。

为了避免不便或者隐私泄露，我们愿意在您选择的地点进行面谈。请告知对于您最方便的地方。如我们之前提到的，我们也可以在波特兰州立大学安排会议室。

如果您需要了解更多关于研究可能带来的风险和不适，请询问研究员。

参与本项研究会给我带来什么好处？

参与本项研究并不能给您带来直接的利益。但是您对于本次研究的贡献可以提升按摩治疗师的职业化过程，使其更具文化相关性，以及改善许可证批核程序。您的参与将极大地帮助 API 群体中希望成为按摩治疗师的人们。最终，大众也会得益于这些技术成熟，服务安全的许可操作的治疗师。

你们将如何保护我个人信息的机密？

我们会采取一系列措施去保护您的所有的信息，但是我们不能担保所有研究信息的机密性。

为了最大化研究数据的机密性，我们会确保所有从您处得到的信息以及所有可能与您身份相关的信息只能够被本次研究小组的成员获得。您的联系信息，面谈笔记，录音及副本都会被保存在一个安全的地方，我们严格限制所有信息仅限研究员。录音的名字会被更改，其它的身份相关信息也会被删掉以保证匿名。

研究记录中的信息将限于研究员使用。波特兰州立大学机构审查委员会将监督有人类参与实验，其它机构可能会被允许获得您的记录，但那会是我们因法律强制而透露您的信息。研究员有法律义务向相关权威机构报告儿童虐待，疏忽照顾儿童，虐待老年人，自残或者伤害他人以及任何威胁生命的情况。如果发生以上状况，您的信息将无法被保密。

您的名字将不会出现在任何公开发表的报告中。

参与研究，我会有经济收益吗？

如果您完成了面谈，我们会提供 15 美元的礼品卡。除此之外，您不能得到其他的经济利益。但是，我们可以报销您到达面谈地点所需的交通花费。

一旦我开始决定参与，我还可以终止吗？

您参与本项研究是完全自愿的。您有权利选择不参与或者在任何时候退出参与，并且不会有任何惩罚或者已获资格益处的损失。

我可以给谁打电话投诉该研究吗？

如果您任何时候有任何问题，关切或者投诉，雅美西芝教授以及逢璐会乐于回答您的问题，请联系 503-449-8192/503-754-4984. 可拨打电话时间包括工作时间之外以及周末。

我可以给谁打电话询问我作为研究参与者的权利？

如果您有任何关于作为研究参与者权利的问题，您可以联系波特兰州立大学科研诚信办公室，(503) 725-2227 或 1(877) 480-4400。科研诚信办公室系支持波特兰州立大学机构审查委员会一办公室。机构审查委员会由波特兰州立大学以及社区成员组成，委员会成员独立监督研究参与人的安全及道德问题。更多信息，请您浏览委员会网页：
<https://sites.google.com/a/pdx.edu/research/integrity>

知情书

您在决定是否参与本次研究。您的签名表明您已阅读以上信息（或者研究员已经阅读以上信息）。通过签署知情书，作为研究参与者，您保留您的法律权利。

您得到问问题的机会，并且所有问题的回答都已让您觉得满意。通过签署本知情书，您同意参与本项研究。您会获得一份复印件。

参与者姓名	参与者签名	日期
-------	-------	----

研究员签名

本次研究目的已经向参与者解释并且他/她的所有问题都已得到解答。参与者理解本知情书的信息并且自愿参与。

研究员姓名 Name of Investigator/ Research Team Member (type or print)

研究员签名(Signature of Investigator/ Research Team Member) 日期 Date