Voices of Teacher Graduates: Preparation for Black Mattering in Schools

Loyce E. Caruthers  
*University of Missouri-Kansas City, caruthersl@umkc.edu*

Jennifer Waddell  
*University of Missouri-Kansas City, waddellj@umkc.edu*

Bradley Poos  
*University of Missouri-Kansas City, poosbw@umkc.edu*

Ashley N. Smith  
*EduSigner, LLC, Ashmith@edusigner.com*

Follow this and additional works at: [https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/nwjte](https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/nwjte)

Part of the [Elementary and Middle and Secondary Education Administration Commons](https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/nwjte), [Elementary Education and Teaching Commons](https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/nwjte), [Higher Education and Teaching Commons](https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/nwjte), [Junior High, Intermediate, Middle School Education and Teaching Commons](https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/nwjte), [Other Teacher Education and Professional Development Commons](https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/nwjte), and the [Urban Education Commons](https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/nwjte)

Let us know how access to this document benefits you.

**Recommended Citation**

Caruthers, Loyce E.; Waddell, Jennifer; Poos, Bradley; and Smith, Ashley N. (2021) "Voices of Teacher Graduates: Preparation for Black Mattering in Schools," *Northwest Journal of Teacher Education*: Vol. 16 : Iss. 2 , Article 9.  
DOI: [https://doi.org/10.15760/nwjte.2021.16.2.9](https://doi.org/10.15760/nwjte.2021.16.2.9)

This open access Article is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License (CC BY-NC-SA 4.0). All documents in PDXScholar should meet accessibility standards. If we can make this document more accessible to you, contact our team.
Voices of Teacher Graduates: Preparation for Black Mattering in Schools

Abstract
The Institute for Urban Education (IUE) began in 2005, following unitary status of Kansas City Public Schools in 2003, as a four-year undergraduate urban teacher preparation program to prepare students to interrupt school-centered practices of Eurocentric identity and antiblackness. A program feature entails recruitment of high school students from urban communities and scholarships to support full-time preparation without employment distractions. Graduates commit to teach for a minimum of four-years in an urban school. Our investigation incorporated BlackCrit with in-depth interviews to capture the experiences of nine graduates in the schools where they teach or engage in school leadership. While testimonials from graduates indicate success of the program, our investigation underscores new pathways for Black valuing of youth and their communities.

Keywords
Anti-racism, Teacher preparation, Black mattering, urban education, antiblackness, Black Critical Theory

Creative Commons License
This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-Share Alike 4.0 International License.
Introduction

While the inequities of Black students have systematically been raised by scholars (Dumas, 2014, 2016; Milner IV, 2012; Morris, 2007), Black mattering in education is more significant because of the #BlackLivesMatter movement that raised consciousness about the ongoing marginalization of Black people (Carey, 2019). We define Black mattering as being cared for and feeling that one counts—a sense of belonging tied to perceptions of others and self-esteem (Carey, 2019; Schlossberg, 1989). The antiblack sentiments of desegregation in Kansas City Public Schools (KCPS) compelled us to confront Black mattering in teacher preparation.

KCPS confronted over two decades of failed desegregation efforts (Gotham, 2002). Surrounding suburban districts looked on with antiblack sentiments regarding possibilities of Black students attending their respective white schools. Dumas (2016) described such sentiments as straining "against the dark." He argued,

In this nation that has ostensibly advanced beyond Black and white, it is the Black that becomes anachronistic, an impediment to the realization of Americans’ national-popular imagination of who “we” want to be. Even as the nation (and indeed, the world) embraces a certain kind of multiculturalism, people strain against the dark. (p. 11-12)

The creation of themed magnet schools to attract white families to the district (Thomas & Hoxworth, 1991) was not considered for Black students before integration efforts in Kansas City. Dumas (2014) pointed out that these attractive programs are clear indicators of deep-seated beliefs regarding antiblackness: that Black students cannot succeed in rigorous programs.

In the aftermath of Jenkins v. Missouri (1984) and the declaration of unitary status in 2003, KCPS tackled ongoing accreditation and academic achievement issues. We used Milner IV’s (2012) description of urban emergent to identify the Kansas City community and surrounding "fiscally stressed suburbs and towns" (Anyon, 2014, p. 9) with challenges of housing, poverty, and transportation similar to urban intensive environments. One of the first undergraduate programs of its kind, the Institute for Urban Education (IUE) began in 2005 as a four-year undergraduate teacher preparation program to interrupt school-centered practices of Eurocentric identity and support Black mattering (Coles, 2019, 2021; Coles & Powell, 2020; Dumas, 2014, 2016; Dumas & Ross, 2016; Khalifa, 2018; Warren & Coles, 2020).

The IUE is located within a predominantly white institution with a bleak history of equity in Kansas City (Friend & Caruthers, 2012). To mitigate past inequities, including voices of the community in the design of IUE programming was critical for university leaders. A unique design entails recruiting high school students from urban communities and providing robust scholarships to support
full-time teacher preparation. In return, graduates commit to teach for a minimum of four years in an urban school.

Program features of the IUE include (a) cohort model to support collaborative learning structures with faculty and students; (b) immersion experiences in the community; (c) learning about the systemic racism that has created a deeply segregated and marginalized community; (d) early field experiences in urban schools; (e) programming that focuses on understanding self, implicit bias, personal beliefs, and interactions with others; (f) courses taught in urban schools and communities; (g) culturally relevant and social justice pedagogy; and (h) a focus on building authentic relationships with students and families.

In contrast to the IUE with a 91% five-year retention rate, attrition rates of novice teachers in urban schools vary with 50% for five years in some and 12.5% for other schools (Garcia & Weiss, 2019). An IUE graduate interrogated what is needed to educate marginalized students:

The IUE prepared me to build relationships with families because we spent a lot of time with students, but we also got to know their families. How do we incorporate their funds of knowledge into our classroom? How are we culturally relevant? How do we understand our own bias and thought process when it comes to getting to know students? (Interview notes)

**Purpose of Our Inquiry**

We used in-depth interviews to apprehend the stories of IUE graduates regarding preparation for Black mattering. BlackCrit integrated with narrative inquiry uncovered themes of Black mattering within participants' resistance stories relayed through interviews. Bell (2009) described resistance stories like those of individuals in local communities who fight to counter stock stories, hegemonic narratives that preserve white supremacy. Dumas and Ross (2016) theorized BlackCrit as a response to Critical Race Theory (CRT) to analyze "how the specificity of (anti)blackness matters in explaining how Black bodies become marginalized, disregarded and disdained in schools and other spaces of education" (p. 415). They maintained CRT "does not, on its own, have a language to richly capture how anti-Blackness constructs Black subjects, and positions them in and against the law, policy, and everyday life" (p. 417). In thinking about the methods for this study, we were cautioned by St. Pierre (2015) not to fit our work to qualitative methods that would keep us from finding new possibilities. St. Pierre suggested that the "new empiricist researcher, then, is on her own, inventing inquiry in the doing" (p. 81).

BlackCrit evaluates "the absence and presence of Blackness, including how it functions structurally, narratively, emotionally, ideologically, and otherwise" (Gardner, 2020, p. 9). Our findings "point our collective index fingers in the general direction of Ellisonian something-elseness, along with the values it
attaches to ideas about race, reality, and their interconnections" (Jackson, 2005, p. 33). We provide key recommendations related to Black mattering to intentionally embed racial sincerity for teacher preparation programs.

**Theoretical Framework of Afropessimism**

To illuminate how IUE alumni were prepared to address Black mattering, we drew on Wilderson's (2020) theorizing of Afropessimism to use Blackness as a lens of interpretation—a metatheory. He contended Blackness is social death representing the difference between the flesh and the body absent of social life, thus "conterminous with slavery" (p. 102) and its afterlife in contemporary society. In a real sense, the body "as a normative 'person' with access to citizenship and genealogy" (Shange, 2019, p. 94) is not the experience of Black people in America, and Black students' lives are caught up in the aftermath of slavery, a representative in the flesh. Hartman's (1997) book, *Scenes of Subjection: Terror, Slavery, and Self-making in Nineteenth-Century America*, contributed to Afropessimism for thinking about Blackness through the writings of Black scholars at the turn of the millennium (Olaloku-Teriba, 2018).

Contemplating the institution of slavery, the social realities of antiblackness were depicted by Aranke and Sparks (2017) as a "temporal glitch" (p. 3) of a past that feels too close to the contemporary lives of Black students in schools. Warren and Coles (2020) pointed to the use of slavery to maintain the meaning of whiteness:

> The economic institution of slavery was enacted, in part, to maintain whiteness as superior, and thus, such violence against black people became a necessity. … disregard for black life is parallel with the intentional social construction of black people as inhuman—broken objects in need of adjustment or repair. (p. 385)

Studying whiteness in the age of colorblindness and the recent backlash against Critical Race Theory, Lewis's (2004) argument is significant, "the racialization of whites thus is inherently at some level about domination because the category's very existence is dependent on the continuation of white supremacy …" (p. 625) which engages colonial structures of power. The frames of BlackCrit support the examination of how Blackness operates in schools and other institutions.

**The Frames of BlackCrit**

Adopting the perspective of Afropessimism as a metatheory aided the use of BlackCrit as a method for addressing Black mattering, entangled in a post-colonial discourse that constructs "othering" of Black people in U.S. institutions, including schools (Davis, 2018; Gardner, 2020). Dumas and Ross's (2016) frames of BlackCrit pushes the gaze inward and outward, including the antagonistic
relationship between Blackness and (the possibility) for humanity, the neoliberal-multicultural imagination, and Black liberatory fantasy

Understanding the antagonistic relationship between Blackness and possibilities of humanity recognizes that antiblackness is embedded in a theory of Afropessimism that insists Black people exist in the imagination of the slave (Sexton, 2011; Wilderson, 2020). The Black is viewed as inhuman, which produces policies and practices of Black suffering in schools. Dumas and Ross (2016) insisted that Black optimism is a necessary tension with Afropessimism, producing possibilities for freedom and liberation.

Dumas and Ross's (2016) second frame consisted of the neoliberal-multicultural imagination. Antidiscrimination laws were put in place after World War II, the abolishment of Jim Crow laws were eventually dismantled in the 1980s for neoliberal market-driven perspectives, purported racism no longer existed. Hence, the discourse of race is silent in neoliberalism, duplicitous with multiculturalism and diversity that explains away the "material conditions of Black people as a problem" (p. 430).

Further, BlackCrit, asserted by Dumas and Ross (2016), espouses a Black liberatory fantasy through a collective Black struggle—not the death of police or destruction of human beings. They advocated Black liberatory "fantasy as the eradication of a prison and the beginning of a necessary chaos. It represents the beginning of the end. It is the first taste of freedom" (p. 431). Black liberatory fantasy resists the erasures of white people from a history of racial dominance. Afropessimism, as a lens of interpretation for disrupting antiblackness, holds possibilities for the humanity of Black students.

**Review of Relevant Literature**

Emotionally devastating to their psychological well-being, Black children find it difficult to escape negative images and perceptions about who they are (Coles, 2019; Hope et al., 2015). We summarize some of these difficulties to bring light to how Black students may experience antiblackness and selected literature that spoke to the marginalization and disdain of Black bodies in schools and other educational spaces (Dumas & Ross, 2016). Significant to this discussion is the preparation of teachers for Black mattering to disrupt deficit narratives of race.

**Experiences of Black Students with Antiblackness in Schools**

Cultural and historical precepts from the larger society shape our economic, political, and social lives and have consequences for Black children's social and emotional development, influencing their educational experiences (Hope et al., 2015). Dumas (2014) emphasized, "for many black children and families in the United States, Britain, and elsewhere, schooling is a site of
suffering … that we have been least willing or able to acknowledge or give voice in educational scholarship and … educational policy analysis” (p. 2).

Warren and Coles (2020) maintained that Black students live with the aftermath of slavery that "continues to operate both as ideology and practice" (p. 385) through interpersonal assaults, curricular assaults, and environmental assaults. The authors illuminated examples of interpersonal and curricular assaults:

At Spring Valley High School in Columbia, SC, 16-year-old Shakara was placed in a chokehold by a white male school officer, then flipped out of her desk and dragged across the classroom floor. Shakara faced misdemeanor charges for disturbing the school after the incident (Craven, 2015).

The New York University Metro Center analyzed three prominent curricula used at the elementary level in NYC public schools (the Teachers College Reading and Writing Project, the Pearson ReadyGen curriculum, and the Scholastic booklist) and found that authors of books and curriculum materials are still overwhelmingly white despite the diversity of NYC public schools [schools’] students. Authors of color are practically absent from the curricular tools (Hester, 2018, p. 387).

Interpersonal, curricular, and environmental assaults have become routine acts of antiblackness; Black students are positioned as problems.

Carey (2019) contended that "Black boys and young men appear to be disposable in U.S. society, considering police shootings, mass incarceration, disproportionate health disparities, and the continual struggle for access to quality education" (p. 371). McIntosh et al. (2014) reported more than half of Black males are suspended once each year in some districts. Direct correlations with suspensions, dropping out of school, and incarceration of Black bodies exist; part of the new Jim Crow, as Alexander (2010) expounded, among a racial caste that is "permanently locked out of mainstream, white society by law, custom, and practice" (p. 185).

Concomitantly, Black girls experience antiblackness in schools and fall through the cracks, a result of the failure of educators to address instances of sexual harassment, marginalization, and oppression that require understanding their unique experiences at the intersections of race, class, and gender (Harris & Kruger, 2020; Ricks, 2014). Joseph et al. (2016) interviewed 18 Black girls who revealed their definitions of racism, including prejudice, discrimination, differential treatment, stereotypes, and low teacher expectations. Morris (2007) asserted that "Black girls have been perceived as defiant, delinquent, aggressive, too sexy, too proud, and too loud to be treated with dignity in their schools" (p. 13). Measured against whiteness, Black girls are often viewed as not fitting the
school’s culture and behaving in ways that are contradictory to ideals of white womanhood.

For Black children and youth being the "other" is considered something different from the norm perpetuated by a lens of white supremacy (Tatum, 2017). The disdain of Black bodies is portrayed in educational research with "phrases such as at-risk, endangered, remedial, in crisis, ineducable, extinct, and left behind" (Howard, 2013, p. 57). Others reported Black students are under-represented in gifted education programs and advanced placement (A.P.) classes and overrepresented in special education (Blanchett, 2006; Schott Foundation for Public Education, 2015; Shah & Coles, 2020). Preparing teachers for Black mattering in schools may lead to the eradication of antiblackness.

**Pre-service Education for Black Mattering**

Despite the limited literature pertaining to teacher preparation for Black mattering, current literature emphasizes the need to bring race and racial issues to the forefront of teacher preparation (Shah & Coles, 2020); support critical reflection regarding racial identities, biases, and experiences (Gay & Kirkland, 2003; Gorski & Dalton, 2020); and prepare teachers to teach in culturally relevant ways (Gay, 2010; Ladson-Billings, 2014). "Critical reflection challenges learners to see themselves as transformers, not just of their own values but also of the institutions and societies with which they interact" (Gorski & Dalton, 2020, p. 359). There must be intentional aspects of preparing beginning teachers to not just enter schools but persist and teach for Black mattering.

However, the use of BlackCrit in teaching is quite revolutionary. Shah and Coles (2020) noted, "being a teacher in a nation where racism is endemic means that no one is exempt from being complicit or directly engaging in racism at points in their lives and careers" (p. 596). Yet, with antiblackness's influence on the social worlds and lived experiences of Black children and youth, "urban educators [may] perpetuate a social education that invisibilizes antiblackness" (Coles, 2019, p. 2).

Preparing teacher candidates (TCs) to understand themselves, their own racial identities, biases, and experiences are challenging, as "teachers often rely on stereotypes of their students based on misconceptions they have acquired about the students' racial or ethnic group" (Milner IV, 2011, p. 61). Teacher preparation programs should include experiences that "challenge their belief systems and result in a change in dispositions" (Warren et al., 2011, p. 109). Incorporating "racial noticing" has been a focus of preparation programs to help T.C.s bring a racial and equity lens to their work in schools. Shah and Coles (2020) theorized racial noticing as different from antiracism that "involves a proactive destabilizing of the ways race and racism operate in everyday life" (p. 586). Racial noticing, like Warren and Coles' (2020) idea of Black Educational Spaces (BES) for humanizing the experiences of Black youth, interprets, attends, and responds to "racial phenomena in learning settings." (p. 586). Shah and Coles
asserted, "broadly speaking, what is needed is continuity across multiple years of coursework in [T.C.'s'] preparation to develop racial noticing skills" (p. 597) for deconstructing systematic racism.

Warren and Coles (2020) purported that BES is inclusive and support multiple dimensions of the humanity of Black students. Self-determination occurs when adults help them become what they want to be through "imagining and agency" (p. 389) instead of fitting into worlds others have created for them. Self-actualization honors Black students' uniqueness and acknowledges women and girls' contributions to the learning environment and values the needs of Black queer and gender-fluid youth. Self-efficacy requires self-concepts which "centers one's deep conviction that they are, for example, beautiful, smart, and capable" (p. 390).

Other BES are fugitivity and racial counterspaces (Warren & Coles, 2020). Fugitivity involves an aftermath of segregation that allows for rebirth and resistance and raises tensions regarding norms of Eurocentric knowledge. Counterspaces are physical gathering places to support the healing of Black youth using same-race networking and enacting Blackness and ties with Black faculty in schools and on campuses. As a team of researchers, we address the complexities of antiblackness and the extent to which alumni were prepared for Black mattering.

**Researchers' Positionality**

Our positioning as researchers is not constant, and, as Squire et al. (2013) pointed out, each of us comes from somewhere, and our passions shift from time to time. What we think we know often becomes strange to us. Through our varied and complex lives in the Northwest and Midwest, we each brought some understanding of antiblackness but had not thought deeply about its complexities. We came together as four researchers, a mixed team from diverse racial and educational backgrounds, each with extreme interest in this project from our lived experiences with racist ideologies and practices in PK-12 schools. Our intent was to reach beyond the boundaries of preparing for diversity to center antiblackness and white supremacy. The current literature for the preparation of teachers for urban schools raised tensions regarding digging beneath routine teaching acts to investigate deeper meanings of race. The use of BlackCrit resonates with the research team's intent to provide richness and description of graduates’ experiences with Black mattering instead of universal tenets that apply to others or promote a "racial progress narrative" (Ray et al., 2017, p.149).

We attended to the following questions: (a) How did your pre-service program help you disrupt antiblackness? (b) In what ways do you engage families and communities in the education of Black children and youth? (c) What do you wish you had learned during your pre-service experience to support Black mattering in schools?
Methodology

While Black Critical Theory or BlackCrit is viewed as a theory, we incorporate it as a method, aligned with narrative inquiry, to deploy an analysis of educational policies and practices (Dumas & Ross, 2016) that dehumanize Black children. Responding to the larger discourse of Afropessimism, we used the frames of BlackCrit to interpret participants' resistance stories. Squire et al. (2013) emphasized "narratives carry traces of human lives that we want to understand. All these areas of enquiry can help us describe, understand and even explain important aspects of the world" (p. 2).

Twenty-nine alumni responded to open-ended survey questions about experiences in the IUE. Respondents included graduates who exited the program from 2009-2014 and self-identified as Black (17), white (12), female (26), and male (3). Purposeful sampling was used to identify nine alumni selected from the survey and consented to share their pre-service experiences regarding Black mattering. Lodico et al. (2010) insisted "the goal of purposeful sampling … is to select person, places, or things that can provide the richest and most detailed information to help us answer our research questions" (p. 134). The analysis of the IUE alumni survey included themes of (a) changes in understanding self and others, (b) importance of building relationships with students and families, and (c) significance of being a culturally relevant educator. These themes were the data for the design of research questions.

We conducted in-depth, semi-structured interviews of 45 to 60 minutes at the convenience of the participants over a three-week period. Sample questions were:

(1) How would you describe the educational needs of Black children/youth?
(2) What practices have you integrated from your pre-service experiences to help you successfully teach Black children/youth?

Transcriptions were developed from audio-taped interviews and uploaded to NVivo 12 Qualitative Data Analysis (2018), which supported coding of interviews and multiple readings from the vantage of BlackCrit, specifically, the three frames (Dumas & Ross, 2016) to identify themes in resistance stories. Thematic analysis "examines the ways in which events, realities, meanings, experiences, and so on are the effects of a range of discourses operating within society" (Braun & Clarke, 2006, p. 81). Findings follow with a discussion of participants and themes related to Black mattering in participants' resistance stories.
**Findings**

This program showed me that to truly understand and embrace cultures different from my own; I must first go through a process to understand and embrace my own culture. I was forced to face uncomfortable topics such as white privilege, and in doing so, I better understood my own culture and how I fit in with other cultures. In addition, I was able to see how demeaning my thought process of white culture being the norm was and have since been able to change that thinking.

–IUE Graduate (alumni survey)

**Participants**

Pseudonyms selected by the nine interview participants were used in place of names. The participants taught in district and charter schools; the years they exited the program ranged from 2009-2013, with an average of 8.1 years of teaching (see Table 1). Two of the participants became elementary principals, and one an assistant principal.

Table 1

*Demographics of Interview Participants*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Year exit</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Race/Ethnicity</th>
<th>Years in Education</th>
<th>Current Assignment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Angie</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>female</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Teacher/District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ella Baker</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>female</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Teacher/Charter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grace</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Teacher/District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MellieTee</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Teacher/District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russell</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Teacher/Rural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sally</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>female</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Principal/Charter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marva</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>female</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Teacher/Charter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theresa</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Principal/Charter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tiffany</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>female</td>
<td>Black</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Asst. Principal/Charter</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Resistance Stories**

The three most salient themes identified in the interview data were *pre-service preparation for Black mattering, involving families and communities*, and *trusted spaces for learning*. We report on themes, tensions, and contradictions
embedded in graduates' resistance stories using Dumas and Ross's (2016) three frames of BlackCrit.

**Theme 1: Pre-service Preparation for Black Mattering**

Theme 1, regrading *preparation for Black mattering*, portrayed the three frames of BlackCrit with some resistance stories more critical and fluid and others expressing subtleness concerning the antagonistic relationship between Blackness and the possibility of humanity in district and charter schools. We also encountered expressions of tensions between Blackness and the "neoliberal-multicultural imagination" where race is silenced. References to building Black liberatory spaces were not as apparent in their stories.

Theresa said being culturally relevant is practiced in her school, in contrast to antagonistic relationships that reduce the possibilities of humanity. As a white teacher, she expressed, "It's normal for our Black students to feel comfortable discussing racial issues … to read a piece of Black literature and discuss racial inequities and really be honest about how they feel." The silencing of race, the neoliberal-multicultural imagination, was not apparent in her story.

MellieTee, a white educator, cogently explained how Black Lives Matter birth the challenges of Back mattering in education and the hard work of recognizing antiblackness. She stated, "the trauma in Black communities, runs deep because of the white supremacist practices that have existed in this country for centuries. … It's been to light through reconstruction, Jim Crow, and now the new Jim Crow." Her narrative brought from the margins is align to the Black liberatory fantasy to resist the erasures of white people from a history of supremacy and racial dominance (Dumas & Ross, 2016). Ella adopted the pseudonym of Ella Baker, a Black civil rights activist and co-founder of the Southern Christian Leadership Conference (SCLC). She elucidated the importance of reducing antagonistic relationships with Black early adolescent students:

This was my last year in 6th grade, and I said, "you know what? I'm going to teach what I want to teach. … I taught the book *Ghost Boys* … the conversations that I had with students were so deep and so powerful that sometimes I would have chills, and I would just sit there and listen. And the students would be like, "__________, are you going to say anything?" And I would say no, I just want to let you guys talk. [We talked about] how we do things subconsciously to protect ourselves. The kids were having the debates about policing, and … I let them talk. … It was a safe space where they could kind of push back on each other. It was never disrespectful, and it was with one of my hardest and toughest classes that I had the most success with when I came to that lesson … I still get chills about the things that we talked about and sharing my experiences.
Ella was one of the few graduates willing to have critical conversations about policing including sharing her experiences. Hope et al. (2015) pointed out, "while Black children are aware of racism at an early age, schooling experiences and new advance cognitive abilities during adolescence allow for a prime opportunity to interrogate race, racism, and discrimination" (p. 103). Meaningless talk regarding Black humanity was looked on with suspicion by Ella.

She voiced the importance of actions instead of meaningless talk related to Black mattering, connecting to a wishful vision of Black liberatory fantasy, a collective Black struggle. "Schools are trying to say, 'oh I'm doing these things, we support this and that,' trying to be anti-racist. I think one of the biggest challenges is, 'yes, you're saying that,' but are you actually putting in the work?" Warren and Coles (2020) viewed challenges with "putting in the work" as hegemonic power that continues to establish whiteness as dominant in schools.

Tiffany, a Black educator, mentioned attending a seminar on John Lewis's letter and incidents in the capital that affect Black mattering in schools, finding it important to help elementary students grasp a similar frame of Blackness and humanity, captured in Ella's resistance story.

Understanding what they [students] may be thinking or what they may be hearing. Hey, we know that this may come up, and how do we address that as a school. … and we know that it affects Black children differently and Black communities.

Grace, a white teacher, perceived teachers need to talk about race before entering urban classrooms, related to race silencing in the neoliberal-multicultural perspective.

It is very difficult for me to imagine classrooms where there are teachers who maybe haven't explored their race and the impact it might have in a classroom. … We need teachers who have had conversations actively and felt uncomfortable and explored who they are before going into a classroom.

MillieTee continued a resistance story of Black liberatory fantasy that defies the erasures of white people from a history of supremacy and racial dominance (Dumas & Ross, 2016). "As a white educator, a lot of reckoning needs to happen … to be a successful teacher of Black children … reflect on my internal practices and beliefs that … come from a white supremacist narrative."

These educators also spoke about the power of considering Black families and communities in the education of children, but most gave attention to traditional forms of parent and community involvement; generally, hierarchical such as parents asked to volunteer in schools, attend meetings or participate in
activities with children with less emphasis on nontraditional roles of parents as decision-makers (Shen et al., 2014).

**Theme 2: Involving Families and Communities**

Meaningful integration of families and communities within the culture of schools encourages community-based knowledge and care that "humanize student identities" (Khalifa, 2018, p. 159). The integration of hip-hop with subject areas is an example of community-based knowledge to support culturally relevant pedagogy and critical consciousness (Ali, 2015; Ladson-Billings, 2014). A Pasadena, California teacher used hip-hop music and culture to help students critically examine the racially charged history of the U.S. and its effects on neighborhoods and communities (Geffner, 2018).

Traditional parent and community involvement further antiblackness forms of knowledge that are antagonistic regarding prospects of Blackness and humanity instead of exemplifying inclusivity of parents’ ideas about educating their children as reflected in Grace’s communication. She said, "calling parents, emailing parents, or sending letters to parents at the beginning of the school year to introduce myself and to say hi … when I’m working with parents, how I come to the table is very important." Grace’s attempts to involve parents represent one-way communication at an unconscious level, a barrier to community-based knowledge.

A Black principal's resistance story of parent and community involvement in a charter school reflects a similar frame of the possibilities of Blackness and humanity. Sally described the school’s goal of a five-year strategic plan to obtain family and community involvement; the focus appeared to be on getting feedback, a hierarchical practice of obtaining support from parents and community members, instead of partnering with them regarding teaching and learning.

For example, we're changing our bell schedule and structure next year, and of course, we reach out to the parents. We have something called a parent action committee, and we meet with them … once a month to share updates and get feedback from them … ensure that we're aligned and partnering.

The hesitancy to value the voices of Black parents and other parents may be associated with white supremacy. Gardner (2020) expressed, the "anti-Black selective tradition, the historical and continued practice of omitting, limiting, tokenizing, and disregarding Blackness, including Black voices, visualities, subjectivities, and, by extension, Black people's ways of knowing, being in, and narrating the world" (p. 9).

As a Black educator, Angie lived in the community and stated she was nervous about privacy, but students enjoyed seeing her in the community and at
stores where they shopped. "The kids will drive by or walk by in the morning and say, 'hi _____.' They want to kind of have that interaction." Angie admitted she had not been able to use the community as a resource, but "I try to make my parent contact as positive as I can and as frequent as I can before we get to any issues." Her commentary bodes with the expectation that Black children are expected to confront discipline, even those who have not yet done so (Warren & Coles, 2020), which can be viewed as an antagonistic relationship between Blackness and humanity.

Ella's talk about barriers of COVID-19 and the relationships she builds with families more closely mirrors Khalifa's (2018) notions of community-based knowledge to understand the possibilities of humanity for Black children. "When I'm talking to their parents and talking to them, I'm just like, 'okay I know it's hard, how can I better assist you so that you can get something accomplished so that you feel successful at the end of the day?'" Black Critical Theory, in resisting antiblackness, is quite revolutionary. Connected to trusted spaces of learning, Ella's comments also necessitate having high expectations and relationships with Black students and their parents.

**Theme 3: Trusted Spaces for Learning**

To establish trusted spaces for learning, Black students and parents must perceive school policies and practices as fair, aiding the eradication of antagonistic relationships. Coles and Powell (2020) cautioned schools to operate with the understanding that unfairness is "embedded within schooling and therefore when Black youth articulate feelings of wrongdoing, educators must listen" (p. 123). Trusting relationships involve educators "a willingness [being willing] to make oneself vulnerable to another based on a belief in that person's benevolence, honesty, openness, reliability, and competence" (Tschannen-Moran, 2017, p. 4). When trust is non-existent or broken, the performance of both teachers and students is affected (Muhammad, 2018). MellieTee emphasized a student-centered classroom for humanizing the worlds of Black children "so that the children can work together with my guidance. … the skill of being a warm demander … being warm and open and allowing the children, as guides or facilitators, to create their own class constitution." MillieTee connected to a frame of Black Crit, and she understood "warm demanders work tirelessly for the success of children and insist on a culture of achievement, equity, and mutual respect" (Ross et al., 2008, p. 143).

A surprising finding was several participants' unconscious understanding of ways fictive kinship contribute to trust between teachers, parents, and students, unknowingly dispelling frames of antagonist relationships of Black humanity and the neoliberal-multicultural imagination. Fictive kinship is connected to the Black community's cultural roots of communal childrearing, a traditional West African structure carried with them in their arrival as slaves in the Americas (Chatters et
Reference to "we are like family" signals the concept of fictive kinship within the Black community and other communities of color (Ngo et al., 2018). Marva, a Black teacher, suggested trusting classroom environments for Black children entail the power of a "triangle of a partnership … in your classroom because if they know, she's [teacher] gonna call my mother good or bad then I'm going to ask this particular way because she really does care and so those relationships are crucial." Marva communicated the power of fictive kinship for establishing positive relationships with students through connecting with parents—the triangle consists of teachers, students, and parents. Marva felt knowing the communities of students and the issues faced by Black children was extremely important for teaching. She said, "it's not just a relationship in the classroom; you have to build it with the family, with the community. … knowing they can come to you no matter what the situation." Most alumni did not mention partnering with parents and communities regarding teaching and learning. Indeed, Marva's view represented humanizing the world of Black children, a BlackCrit frame.

Ella expressed attitudes of some Black children at her charter school were often affected by trauma, and "they really were very closed off. It took a while for those relationships to form." According to Ella, lack of trust may be attributed to a constant stream of new teachers or socialization in the home. She said these were middle school students, and they did not like me to sound like "their mama." "We came up with a balance of, 'I can talk to you like I'm your mama, but I can also talk to you in this way so that we can build a relationship.'" Ella associated the notion of fictive kinship as being a warm demander and did not see the conditions of her Black students as problems, a neoliberal-multicultural ideology.

Participants also described culturally relevant pedagogy and project-based learning to support trusted spaces for learning. Grace described how she woke up one morning and decided to do what was right for kids instead of asking for permission.

We know that the system of education has so many challenges. … how do I navigate those for my students in a way that I think is fair. [Such as] testing, not always culturally written. … I don't have a good answer for it. … I do think that I found the fire to fight the battles, if that makes sense.

She had decided to resist the pervasive Eurocentric ideology that operated in her school; linked to dispelling Black Crit frames of antagonist relationships and Black humanity and views related to the neoliberal-multiculturalism imagination. Russell, currently teaching in a rural district, supported culturally relevant pedagogy for predominantly Black charter school students.

I think there's a huge need to have a curriculum that represents Black students. I am proud of the work that I did in Kansas City in that area, working closely with one of my best friends and colleagues, who is an
African American male [man], to build a curriculum that goes beyond textbook companies.

In Russel's rural district, where the student population was increasingly diverse, attention was given to what he described as "human resource forms of diversity," the neoliberal-multicultural forms of diversity, especially valued by the corporate world. The language of diversity does little to destroy the vestiges of antiblackness in schools (Wilderson, 2020).

**Discussion of Findings**

Antiblackness, linked to the emergence of the post-racial paradigm of Afropessimism, is viewed "far more than any contemporary perspective" (Warren & Coles, 2020, p. 392) to shed light regarding conditions that keep Black people from engaging an imagination of becoming. To address the question related to disrupting antiblackness, most of their resistance stories were not critical enough to reveal the deeper contours of Black mattering connected to antiblackness. Several graduates understood the importance of providing students with opportunities to discuss race issues. Some found it trying to advocate for the needs of Black children within organizational cultures and structures that protected white dominance. All expressed the importance of being prepared to implement culturally relevant pedagogy but questioned if schools were committed to putting these efforts in place.

Black Educational Spaces (BES) raise the question of non-black educators and other adults to share spaces for the support of Black youth and adults. Coles (2021) described the challenge in this manner: "Antiblackness as an arm of white settler supremacy has socially constructed deficits within Blackness, resulting in a world where equating Blackness with deficiency has become routine" (p.3). Hence, engaging family and community through elements of community-based knowledge for humanizing the educational experiences of Black students was a real struggle for most graduates. They were more comfortable with traditional forms of parent and community involvement.

Regarding what is needed to support Black mattering in schools, five of the nine participants offered suggestions for strengthening pre-service preparation: (a) integrate IUE conversations with other coursework, such as science; (b) interview students regarding sense of belonging and learning styles; (c) extend IUE mentoring beyond the first couple of years of teaching; (d) provide support for the mental health of teachers during the first two years; (e) acquire skills to work with children who experience trauma; and (e) increase ways to build relationships with kids and hold them accountable in safe and nurturing ways. Most suggestions involved the need to have deeper conversations regarding eradicating antiblackness for critically supporting Black mattering in schools. Expansion to other coursework signals the expansion of preparation for Black mattering at every aspect of teacher preparation.
Conclusion

Ella and Grace's resistance stories illustrated mistrust regarding the support of districts and schools for Black mattering and the valuing of Black students within and outside of schools. Howard (2020) expressed a confusing moment after fighting resistance to teaching Black students for years; schools must ask why they allow teachers with deeply rooted attitudes of antiblackness to teach Black children. Black mattering is significant for understanding a new path forward to radical, revolutionary teaching.

We recommend teacher preparation and leadership programs take on a critical and intentional understanding of Black mattering by adopting the frames of BlackCrit to establish Black Educational Spaces (BES) advocated by Warren and Coles (2020) for the liberation of Black children. To support self-determination, self-actualization, and self-efficacy for "(re)humanizing the education experiences of all black youth—black girls, queer and non-binary black youth included" (p. 390)—cultural symbols, practices, and traditions should be incorporated.

As a form of antiblackness, Black students are often forced to assimilate to Eurocentric identity instead of the protection of their identities through the process of "identity confluence" (Khalifa, 2018, p. 110), where students' identities are encouraged and supported through local identities of community-based knowledge. It is also important to consider the role of school leaders in creating schools and school contexts that are committed to Black mattering. Khalifa (2018) pointed to the implementation of culturally responsive school leadership (CRSL) to value Black bodies and communities at every level of the system. CRSL must be supported by central office administrators and staff working toward culturally responsive and equitable schooling; encouraging high academic expectations and academic identities; offering mentoring for faculty, and building educational bridges between schools and communities.

The experiences of Black students will not improve until there is a decided and comprehensive effort to eradicate antiblackness. A certain pervasive "want to" is necessary to enact meaningful change and begins with recognizing that change is possible and necessary for liberation.

Notes On The Contributors

**Dr. Loyce Caruthers**, Professor of Educational Leadership, Policy and Foundations at the University of Missouri-Kansas City, teaches courses related to educational administration and qualitative research. She also serves as Coordinator of the Educational Doctorate Program in Pk-12 Educational Administration. Dr. Caruthers has extensive experience in Pk-12 urban education.
including teacher, central office administrator, and Assistant Superintendent of Curriculum and Instruction. Her research involves the social context of urban schools with an emphasis on exploring phenomena related to race, class, language, gender, and other differences that may influence educators’ beliefs and perceptions, and ultimately their work in schools.

**Dr. Jennifer Waddell** serves as the Director for the Institute for Urban Education (IUE). IUE’s mission is to recruit, prepare and support teachers for Kansas City area schools. Dr. Waddell is also the Sprint Foundation Endowed Professor in Urban Education and Co-Chair of the Division of Teacher Education and Curriculum Studies. Her research and related projects focus on urban education, teacher leadership, social justice in education and teacher preparation for historically underserved communities. Dr. Waddell is interested in educational equity, social justice in education, teacher leadership and teacher preparation.

**Dr. Brad Poos** is currently the Associate Director at the University of Missouri—Kansas City’s Institute for Urban Education (IUE), an urban teacher preparation scholarship program within UMKC’s School of Education. Dr. Poos has experience in both k-12 and higher education, and his research focuses on issues related to the historical and social context of schooling. In particular, Dr. Poos is interested in the history of urban education, urban teacher preparation, social justice education, and diversity and educational equity.

**Dr. Ashley Smith**, CEO and Founder of EduSigner, fuses design thinking and healing-centered practices to partner with organizations as they empower those silenced by society. Dr. Smith has served as a middle school teacher, a high school administrator, and has led trainings on literacy and restorative practices at the district level. Her research involves individual and institutional healing, including shame, disengagement, social-emotional learning, identity, equity, inclusion, and belonging.

**References**


https://digitalcommons.uncfsu.edu/jri/vol1/iss3/4


Friend, J., & Caruthers, L. (2012). Reconstructing the cultural context of urban


Harris, J., & Kruger, A. C. (2020). "We always tell them, but they don't do anything about it!" Middle school Black girls' experiences with sexual harassment at an urban middle school. *Urban Education.* https://doi.org/10.1177/0042085920959131


https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/nwjte/vol16/iss2/9
DOI: 10.15760/nwjte.2021.16.2.9

20


