3-2012

A Narrative Conceptualization of the Imposter Phenomenon: Implications for Supervisors of Beginning Counselors

Joel A. Lane
Portland State University, lanejoel@pdx.edu

Let us know how access to this document benefits you.
Follow this and additional works at: https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/coun_fac
Part of the Counselor Education Commons, and the Student Counseling and Personnel Services Commons

Citation Details
Lane, Joel A., "A Narrative Conceptualization of the Imposter Phenomenon: Implications for Supervisors of Beginning Counselors" (2012). Counselor Education Faculty Publications and Presentations. 27.
https://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/coun_fac/27

This Presentation is brought to you for free and open access. It has been accepted for inclusion in Counselor Education Faculty Publications and Presentations by an authorized administrator of PDXScholar. For more information, please contact pdxscholar@pdx.edu.
A Narrative Conceptualization of the Imposter Phenomenon: Implications for Supervisors of Beginning Counselors

JOEL A. LANE, MA LPC NCC
DEPARTMENT OF COUNSELING
OAKLAND UNIVERSITY
ROCHESTER, MI
Problem Statement

- During practicum, internship, & the beginning years of professional counseling, counselors’ internal models of ‘quality therapy’ are confronted with the realities of practicing for the first time, typically resulting in some degree of anxiety.

- Trainees have differing abilities to understand and cope with this anxiety.

- Some feel as if they have ‘faked’ their way to this point in development, and that their fraudulence is about to be discovered.
Session Goals

- Learn about the imposter phenomenon (IP; Cl ance & Imes, 1978) & characteristics of its experience among beginning counselors

- Apply various Narrative Therapy (White & Epston, 1990) concepts to supervisory practice

- Develop a narrative framework for understanding the IP & how to address it using a narrative supervisory approach
The Imposter Phenomenon (IP)

- Clance & Imes (1978)
- General inability to internalize successes
- Describes individuals (generally high-achieving) who believe:
  - They are incompetent despite contradictory evidence
  - They are less capable than their peers
  - Their abilities are overestimated by peers
  - Others will eventually discover their incompetence
IP Behavior & Personality Correlates

- Theorized to occur more in women, but data point to no differences in frequency of IP by gender (see Royse-Roskowski, 2010; Topping, 1983)

- IP leads some to over-prepare (Caselman, Self, & Self, 2006) & some to self-handicap (Want & Kleitman, 2006)

- Associated with:
  - Trait anxiety (Topping, 1983)
  - Depression (McGregor et al., 2008)
  - Low self-esteem (Sonnak & Towell, 2001)
  - Low self-efficacy (Royse-Roskowski, 2010)
  - High neuroticism & low conscientiousness (Bernard et al., 2002)
  - Proneness to shame (Cowman & Ferrari, 2002)
Differentiating the IP from Low Self-Efficacy

- Royse-Roskowski (2010):
  - Study of master’s & doctoral trainees in various counseling & psychology training programs
  - Counseling self-efficacy & the IP were negatively related; however:
    - Amount of counseling experience (prior experience, months in program, months in practicum, direct hours) positively related to self-efficacy but was not related to the IP
  - Essentially, experience increases self-efficacy, but does not affect the IP
The Dweck model (Elliot & Dweck, 1988)

Two basic motivations for achievement:

1. Learning goals: motivated by desire for knowledge
   - Respond to challenges/failures with resilience
2. Performance goals: motivated by desire to prove intelligence
   - Respond to challenges/failures with helplessness/self-blame

Langford (1990)

- Participants given unsolvable anagrams
- IP strongly correlated with ‘Performance goals’ motivation style
IP in Supervision of Counseling Trainees

- Key challenges for new counselors with IP tendencies:
  - Psychosocial impact-
    - Prone to respond to new challenges & difficulties with feelings of helplessness
    - Prone to anxiety, shame, neuroticism, low conscientiousness
    - Imposter feelings may not diminish with experience
Key challenges for new counselors with IP tendencies (continued):

- Threats to skill level-
  - May result in self-handicapping (procrastination, lack of effort, etc.)

- Threat to supervisory relationship-
  - Difficulty internalizing successes, may either rely on external praise or have difficulty accepting it productively
  - May live in fear of being ‘found out’ by supervisor, instructor, or clients
Narrative Therapy (White & Epston, 1990)

- **Theory**
  - Meaning developed through societal, relational, and experiential influence
  - Helps us categorize & know what to expect (e.g. ‘I am a good student’), which then shapes future understanding

- **Problem conceptualization**
  - Problematic discourses (e.g. ‘I am depressed’) become dominant & *internalized*

- **Therapeutic Goals**
  - Externalize problem narratives
  - Awareness of larger, structural influence (discourses)
  - Choose, gather evidence for, & develop preferred narratives
Applying Narrative Concepts to Supervision

- **Speedy (2000)**
  - Using narrative inquiry to deconstruct dominant professional narrative and develop preferred professional identity
  - Repositioning supervisee as ‘narrator’ and supervisor as ‘critical audience’

- **Carlson & Erickson (2001)**
  - The supervisory power hierarchy can potentially undermine supervisee creativity
  - Framing supervision as a time of knowledge acquisition reinforces a sense of ‘never quite measuring up’
  - Instead, supervision should be a ‘rite of passage’ by which supervisors help supervisees become aware of and utilize their own ‘special’ life knowledge
Narrative Conceptualization of the IP

External praise & validation

Personal narratives intermingle performance & self-worth

Anxiety: temporary relief when successful, amplified when challenged

Dominant societal discourses of comparison, expectations, achievement
Narrative Supervision Goals of Reducing the IP

- Deconstruct & externalize ‘performance = self-worth’ narrative

- Facilitate the awareness & development of supervisee’s unique knowledge and how to utilize it with clients

- Develop ‘thick descriptions’ of self & performance containing both strengths and developmental areas, thereby reducing reliance on external validation
Narrative Supervision Objectives for Reducing the IP

- **Narrative inquiry to develop richer understanding of supervisee’s ability**
  - “There was a lot of complexity in what your client was sharing. Tell me how you were able to put all the pieces together and come up with a response like that.”

- **Externalizing language to personify problem-saturated thinking & promote understanding that problem is separate from supervisee**
  - “Doubt and anxiety want you to think that this session was a disaster. If they weren’t whispering negative thoughts in your ears right now, how do you think your evaluation of the session might be different?”

- **Normalize anxiety associated with the challenges of beginning as a counselor**
  - “You’re embarking on a new journey to do something that is very important to you, and it’s natural for anxiety to want to come along for the ride, too.”
Conclusion

- Beginning counselors are at risk of imposter feelings as anxiety is high and experience & self-efficacy are low.

- Supervisors are in a unique position to play a powerful role in shaping beginning counselors’ understandings of their abilities.

- Narrative therapy offers concepts that are useful for conceptualizing the imposter phenomenon & for deconstructing the dominant narratives linking performance & self-worth and reconstructing a preferred narrative that normalizes strengths & growing edges.


